



Comparative Phonorhetorical Analyses of Speeches in the *Zuo Commentary* and the *Discourses of the States*

JEFFREY R. THARSEN

Abstract Research methods employing large-scale databases of digital texts and digital lexica can assist in the detection of the ways phonetic patterns worked in concert with semantic and syntactic structures in premodern Chinese narrative texts. When applied to the speeches by eminent ministers preserved in the *Zuo Commentary* to the *Spring and Autumn Annals* and the *Discourses of the States*, close examinations of the tripartite framework of sound, meaning, and structure allow a deeper understanding of the phonorhetorical techniques employed by their composers (and/or transmitters), emphasizing key terms and imparting subtle feelings of grandeur and harmony. In comparative context, analyses of stylistic elements at scale provide insights into the rhetorical choices made by different authors in formative periods of Chinese literature, choices that informed and influenced future writers and scholars for millennia thereafter.

Keywords phonorhetoric, rhyme, digital databases, Old Chinese, phonology, philology

It is well known that the *Chunqiu Zuo zhuan* 春秋左傳 (*Zuo Commentary* to the *Spring and Autumn Annals*) and the *Guoyu* 國語 (*Discourses of the States*) have a great deal in common, so much so that Sima Qian 司馬遷 (145–86? BCE) attributed both works to the same author, Zuo Qiuming 左丘明 (556–451 BCE).¹ Or, as Bernhard Karlgren (1889–1978) wrote: “The *Kuo yü* [*Guoyu*] text has a grammar closely allied to that of the *Tso chuan* [*Zuo zhuan*]. . . . On the whole the grammatical systems of the two texts are so congruous, that they must be said to be written in essentially the same dialect, and probably belong to the

same school.”² Over the past century much of the comparative study of the two works has attempted to prove or disprove one as the primary source for the other, or to substantiate an unknown third work as the primary source for both texts.³ Chang Yi-Jen 張以仁 is the modern scholar best known for his work on these questions; in the first sentence of his detailed 1983 article comparing these works, he succinctly explains the nature of their dissimilarities: “The *Spring and Autumn Annals*, being one of the classics, has the significance of ‘extolling good and suppressing evil.’ The *Zuo Commentary* then proceeds to confirm the classic by drawing connections with historical events, thereby illuminating the doctrine of the *Spring and Autumn Annals*. *Discourses of the States*, however, is a work designed to illuminate virtue, not only differing greatly from the classic and commentary in style of expression, but diverging widely from them in substance.”⁴

As opposed to semantic exegesis, a much less explored basis of comparison for the *Zuo Commentary* and the *Discourses* is the range of rhetorical forms and styles employed within each text and, in particular, the phonorhetorical devices each text employs within the long, moralizing speeches by ministers to their sovereigns.⁵ It is the aim of this article to present a few representative examples of finely wrought speeches and to provide analyses of their phonetic patterns and stylistic characteristics as a primary basis for evaluating how they are similar and how they diverge, as recent studies have shown that paying close attention to the ways that the tripartite rhetorical framework of phonetics, metrics, and semantics (sound, form, and meaning) were employed in concert by the author(s) of these texts reveals subtle nuances and underlying rhetorical and literary patterns that have remained largely opaque to readers for millennia.⁶

Examples of Phonetic Patterns, Euphony, and Phonorhetoric in Selected Speeches from the *Zuo Commentary* to the *Spring and Autumn Annals*

Long and eloquent speeches by royal ministers and high officials are a regular feature of the *Zuo Commentary* and the *Discourses of the States* and many of these speeches feature phonetic patterns and phonorhetorical devices.⁷ The analyses provided in the case studies below support the argument that the speeches in the *Zuo Commentary* and the *Discourses of the States* represent a very different genre from previous early Chinese narrative works, such as the Western Zhou bronze inscriptions and the *Shangshu* 尚書 (Classic of Documents), despite the striking similarities both in content (many of these speeches are primarily concerned with the importance of virtue and ritual in governance and are often direct remonstrances by a high official to his superior, the sovereign of the state) and in forms of phonorhetorical patterning. In his discussion

of patterns in early Chinese narrative works like the *Zuo Commentary*, Fu Lipu 傅隸樸 noted: “Historical prose, although not as esteemed as writings which employ rhyme, was influenced by rhymed writings and relatively heavily cadenced. . . . The beauty of the ancients’ venerated literary works is described as ‘chirping metal and singing jade’; as these literary works stressed acoustic rhythm, it is not difficult to detect it.”⁸

The results of these analyses of phonetic patterning in all the speeches of over fifty graphs in length in the *Zuo Commentary* show that most of the longest speeches, including many of those that feature regular use of euphony, phonorhetorical devices, and literary techniques, come in the last four chapters of the work and seem to be a hallmark of the Duke Zhao 昭公 (?–510 BCE) chapter in particular.⁹ No previous scholar has adduced any form of consistent use of phonetic patterning or phonorhetorical devices for these passages. Key words discussed in the detailed phonorhetorical analyses that follow are shown in boldface throughout the phonetics, with line-by-line translation below. Each speech employs a number of distinct euphonic and phonorhetorical patterns, such as regular meter (often tetrasyllabic), perfect rhyme, *he yun* 合韻 (consonance; i.e., homoeoteleuton), repetition and parallelism, phrase-internal rhyming and cross-rhyming, and quotation and citation.¹⁰ When viewed in toto, the speeches also show how phonetically patterned sections tend to alternate with passages featuring no obvious phonorhetorical devices. Despite these commonalities, the speeches in the *Zuo Commentary* are by no means overly formulaic: each speech employs a unique combination of techniques in service to the specific rhetorical goals of its composer, governed predominantly by the events that dictated the time and place of its delivery.

A final note is warranted here on the reconstructions themselves. This study primarily employs Axel Schuessler’s reconstructions as published in his 2009 *Minimal Old Chinese and Later Han Chinese*, on rare occasion also including the pronunciation of specific graphs in the 2015 version of the Baxter-Sagart 2014 system when they significantly diverge from and provide insights into aspects of these words’ Old Chinese pronunciations not represented in Schuessler; Baxter-Sagart reconstructions are marked with “(B)” in the phonetics and translation sections below. The appendix to this article contains a brief discussion of these considerations and how digital dictionaries now make more efficient the process of retrieving all the reconstructed pronunciations of the words for any premodern Chinese text.

As one of the aims of this work is to provide a mechanism via which the phonetics of these texts can be read aloud, I offer the following brief explanations of five components of Schuessler’s notations:

1. The symbol η (analogous to ng) is to be read as it occurs in English.
2. The symbol ∂ is equivalent to the schwa as found in English, for example, in the word *about* (/ə'baʊt/).
3. The circumflex (^) is not a marker of vowel quality but an indicator of a syllabic distinction whose pronunciation is unknown and can be ignored when read aloud.
4. The symbol ʔ is the glottal stop as in the consonant sound separating the vowels in the English word *uh-oh*. In Schuessler's system, when it falls at the end of a reconstructed pronunciation, the glottal stop is primarily a marker of a Middle Chinese *shangsheng* 上聲 (type B) syllable.
5. The symbol *h* following another consonant is an indicator of aspiration, not a sound, and when *h* or *s* falls at the end of a reconstructed pronunciation, in Schuessler's system this indicates a Middle Chinese *qusheng* 去聲 (type C) syllable.¹¹

Speech by Zitaishu in the "Duke Zhao Twenty-Fifth Year" Chapter

Zitaishu 子大叔 (?–506 BCE), a prominent minister from the small state of Zheng 鄭, appears over twenty times in the *Zuo Commentary*. He is mentioned in eight of the Duke Xiang 襄公 (575–42 BCE) chapters, in twelve of the Duke Zhao chapters, and in two of the Duke Ding 定公 (r. 509–495 BCE) chapters, always in the role of the wise minister, speaking eloquently on matters of *li* 禮 (ritual) and *yi* 儀 (proper deportment). His speech in the "Zhaogong ershiwunian zhuan" 昭公二十五年傳 (Duke Zhao Twenty-Fifth Year; 517 BCE) chapter is perhaps his most outstanding single appearance in the text, as he cleverly explains how, through ritual, Heaven-sent models can be effectively transmitted to influence the emotional state of the common people, a concept central to the functioning of the aesthetic state and the foundation of the relationship between the people and their rulers in early China.

The speech begins with a question from Zhao Jianzi 趙簡子 (?–476 BCE), a minister of the state of Jin 晉, who asks Zitaishu, "What are we to understand by [the term] 'ritual'?" In response, Zitaishu provides a wide-ranging explanation of the actors involved in the cosmological framework that provide the models for ritual: Heaven and Earth, the six types of *qi* 氣, the five agents, the five flavors, the five colors, and the five notes. Zitaishu explains that these all are supported by ritual to create love and hatred, pleasure and anger, grief and joy, each in its proper context. Ultimately, he says, by following proper rituals, "one can be in harmony with Heaven and Earth's innate nature, and thereby will long endure."

Zitaishu's Speech in the "Duke Zhao Twenty-Fifth Year" Chapter: Phonetics and Translation

Section 1: *Mise-en-scène, Speakers Named, Sources of Ritual in Nature*

子 大¹² 叔 見 趙 簡 子，
 *tsəʔ *thâs *nhuk *kêns *driauʔ *krênʔ *tsəʔ
 Zitaishu met with Zhao Jianzi;

簡 子 問 揖 讓 周 旋 之 禮 焉，
 *krênʔ *tsəʔ *māns *ts(r)əp *naŋh *tiu *s-wen *tə *rîʔ *ʔan
 Jianzi asked him about the rituals of bowing, yielding precedence, and socializing among people.

對 曰：「是 儀 也， 非 禮 也。」
 *tûts *wat *deʔ *ŋai *laiʔ *pəi *rîʔ *laiʔ
 [Zitaishu] replied, saying, "These are matters of deportment, and not of ritual."

簡 子 曰：「敢 問 何 謂 禮 ？」
 *krênʔ *tsəʔ *wat *kâmʔ *māns *gâi *wəs *rîʔ
 Jianzi said, "May I ask, what are we to understand by [the term] 'ritual'?"

對 曰，
 *tûts *wat
 [Zitaishu] replied, saying:

「吉 也 聞 諸 先 大 夫 子 產 曰：
 *kit *laiʔ *mən *ta *sôn *dâs *pa *tsəʔ *srânʔ *wat
 "Auspicious. I heard the former high official Zichan say,

『夫 禮，
 *ba *rîʔ
 'As for ritual,

天 之 經 也，
 *thîn *tə *kêŋ *laiʔ
 it is the **standard** of **Heaven**,

地 之 義 也，
 *draih *tə *ŋaih *laiʔ
 it is the **righteousness** of the **Earth**,

民 之 行¹³ 也。』
 *min *tə *grâŋ *laiʔ
 and it is the **conduct** of the **people**.'

天 地 之 經，
 *thîn *draih *tə *kêŋ
 [As ritual is] the **standard** of Heaven and Earth,

而 民 實 則 之，
 *nə *min *m-lit *tsâk *tə
 the people model themselves on it.

則 天 之 明，
 *tsâk *thîn *tə *mraŋ
 They model on Heaven's **illumination**,

因 地 之 性，
 *ʔin *draih *tə *seŋh
 according with Earth's **innate qualities**,

生 其 六 氣，
 *sreŋ *gə *ruk *khəs
 producing its six aethers,

用 其 五 行，
 *loŋh *gə *ŋâʔ *grâŋ
 and employing its five **agents**.

氣 為 五 味，
 *khəts *wai *ŋâʔ *məs
 The aethers are the five flavors,

發 為 五 色，
 *pat *wai *ŋâʔ *srək
 manifested as the five colors,

章 為 五 聲，
 *taŋ *wai *ŋâʔ *hieŋ
 patterned as the five **notes**.

淫 則 昏 亂，
 *ləm *tsâk *hmôn *rôns
 With excess, then disorder and chaos ensue,

民 失 其 性，
 *min *lhīt *gə *seŋh
 and the people lose their **innate qualities**."

Section 2: Lists of Enumerated Items to Support the Various Aspects of Ritual

是 故 為 禮 以 奉 之，
 *deʔ *kâh *wai *rîʔ *ləʔ *boŋʔ *tə
 "For this reason, rituals were created in order to uphold them:

為 六 畜¹⁴、五 牲、三 犧，
 *wai *ruk *rhukh *ŋâʔ *sreŋ *səm *hŋai
 There are the six domestic animals, the five victims, and the three sacrifices,

以 奉 五 味，
 *ləʔ *boŋʔ *ŋâʔ *məs
 in order to uphold the five flavors.

為 九 文、六 采、五 章，
 *wai *kuʔ *mən *ruk *tshôʔ *ŋâʔ *taŋ
 There are the nine [emblematic] ornaments, the six hues, and the five methods of display,

以 奉 五 色，
 *lǎʔ *bɔŋʔ *ŋáʔ *srək
 to uphold the five colors.

為 九 歌、 八 風、 七 音、 六 律，
 *wai *kuʔ *kái *prət *pəm *tshit *ʔəm *ruk *rut
 There were made the nine songs, the eight airs, the seven tones, and the six pitches,

以 奉 五 聲。
 *lǎʔ *bɔŋʔ *ŋáʔ *hieŋ
 to uphold the five notes.

為 君 臣 上 下，
 *wai *kwən *gin *daŋh *graʔ
 There were made rulers and ministers, high and low,

以 則 地 義。
 *lǎʔ *tsók *lâih *ŋaih
 in order to model Earth's righteousness.

為 夫 婦 外 內，
 *wai *pa *bəʔ *ŋwâts *núts
 There were made husbands and wives, **interiority** (=the home) and exteriority (=the outside world),

以 經 二 物。
 *lǎʔ *kêŋ *nis *mət / *C.mut (B)¹⁵
 in order to regulate these two **spheres**.

為 父 子、 兄 弟、 姑 姊，
 *wai *baʔ *tsəʔ *hwraŋ *dáiʔ *ká *tsiʔ
 There were made fathers and sons, elder brothers and younger brothers, aunts and sisters,

甥 舅、 昏 媾¹⁶、 姻¹⁷ 亞¹⁸，
 *sreŋ *guʔ *hmân *kôh *ʔin *ʔràkh
 maternal uncles and aunts, relations by marriage, and in-laws,

以 象 天 明。
 *lǎʔ s-jaŋʔ *thín *mraŋ
 in order to provide a semblance for Heaven's illumination.

為 政 事、 庸 力、 行 務，
 *wai *teŋh *s-rəʔ *loŋ *rək *gràŋ *moh
 There were made government and administration, services and works, actions and measures,

以 從 四 時；
 *lǎʔ *dzon *sis *dəʔ
 in order to accord with the four seasons.

為 刑 罰 威 獄，
 *wai *gêŋ *bat *ʔui *ŋok
 There were made punishments and penalties, and the awesome power of **legal proceedings**,

使 民 畏 忌,
 *srəʔ *min *ʔuih *gəh
 causing the people to be awestruck and fearful,

以 類 其 震 曜 殺 戮。
 *ləʔ *rus *gə *təns *liaukh *srət *ruk
 in order to simulate the deadly **forces** of thunder and **lightning**.

為 溫 慈 惠 和,
 *wai *ʔũn *dzə *wis *wài
 There were made mildness and gentleness, kindness and harmony,

以 效¹⁹ 天 之 生 殖, 長²⁰ 育,
 *ləʔ *gráuh *thín *tə *sreŋ *dək *draŋ *luk
 in order to imitate Heaven's **propagation** and long-lasting **care**.

民 有 好²¹ 惡²²
 *min *wəʔ *húʔ *ʔákh
 The people had love and **hatred**,

喜 怒 哀 樂²³,
 *həʔ *nàh *ʔəi *ráuk
 delight and anger, grief and **joy**,

生 于 六 氣。
 *sreŋ *wa *ruk *khəs
 produced by the six aethers."

Section 3: Rationale for Regulation of the "Six Passions"

是 故 審 則 宜 類,
 *deʔ *kàh *lhəmʔ *tsók *ŋai *rus
 "This is the reason why we take care to imitate what is proper and suitable,

以 制 六 志,
 *ləʔ *tats *ruk *təh
 in order to regulate the six passions.

哀 有 哭 泣,
 *ʔəi *wəʔ *khôk *khrəp
 To grief belongs crying and tears;

樂 有 歌 舞,
 *ráuk *wəʔ *kái *maʔ
 to joy belongs song and dance;

喜 有 施 舍,
 *həʔ *wəʔ *lhai *lhaʔ
 to delight belongs bestowal and forgiveness;

怒 有 戰 鬥,
 *nàh *wəʔ *tans *dôh
 to anger belongs conflict and struggle.

喜 生 於 好，
 *həʔ *sreŋ *ʔa *hùh
 Delight is born of love,

怒 生 於 惡。
 *náh *sreŋ *ʔa *ʔákh
 anger is born of hatred.”

Section 4: *Justifications for “Regulating Life and Death” to Create Harmony*

是 故 審 行 信 令，
 *deʔ *káh *lhəmʔ *grāŋ *sins / *s-ni[ŋ]-s (B) *rèŋh
 “For this reason we must take care in **instituting trustworthy commands**,

(行)²⁴ 禍 福 賞 罰，
 (*grāŋ) *góiʔ *pək *hjaŋʔ *bat
 (instituting) calamity and blessings, rewards and punishments,

以 制 死 生。
 *ləʔ *tats *siʔ *sreŋ
 in order to regulate death and **life**.

生， 好 物 也，
 *sreŋ *hùh *mət *laiʔ
 Life is a good **thing**,

死， 惡 物 也；
 *siʔ *ʔákh *mət *laiʔ
 death is an evil **thing**.

好 物， 樂 也，
 *hùh *mət *ràuk *laiʔ
 Good **things** are joyous,

惡 物， 哀 也。
 *ʔákh *mət *ʔəi *laiʔ
 evil **things** are sorrowful.

哀 樂 不 失，
 *ʔəi *ràuk *pə *lhít
 When sorrow and joy are not lost,

乃 能 協 于 天 地 之 性，
 *nəʔ *nəŋ *gép *wa *thín *draih *tə *seŋh
 then one can be in harmony with Heaven and Earth’s **innate nature**,

是 以 長 久。』
 *deʔ *ləʔ *draŋ *kweʔ
 and thereby will long endure.”

Section 1: The opening section provides the context for Zitaishu’s long explanatory speech on ritual via the figure of Zhao Jianzi, who asks him about

“the rituals of bowing, yielding precedence and socializing among people.” Zitaishu tells him that these are aspects of deportment, not ritual, setting the stage for Zhao Jianzi to ask the main question that the speech will answer: “What are we to understand by [the term] ‘ritual?’” Zitaishu quotes the minister Zichan 子產 of Zheng (?–522 BCE), one of the most erudite officials portrayed in the *Zuo Commentary*, employing *he yun* consonance based on *-ŋ vocalization to emphasize the key terms: “standard” (*jing* 經 *kêŋ) and “conduct” (*xing* 行 *grâŋ). The first graphs in the rhyming phrases, “Heaven” (*tian* 天 *ŋin) and “the people” (*min* 民 *miŋ), also comprise part of the overall phonorhetorical structure (as well as being semantically significant, these words are perfect rhymes; they fall in direct rhyme position in two poems in the *Classic of Poetry* 詩經 [*Shi jing*]), and thus the second and fourth lines here form a particularly resonant and perfectly parallel phonorhetorical pattern.²⁵ The semantically important words in first and third position in the third line, “Earth” (*di* 地 *draih) and “righteousness” (*yi* 義 *ŋaih), also rhyme perfectly and would have added further emphasis to the “A 之 a 也” repetitive tetrasyllabic phonetic pattern.

The quotation also introduces the pattern of *-ŋ *he yun* cross-rhyming and homoeoteleuton that will ring through the next eleven lines of this opening section. With the exception of the second line, which contains five graphs (ending in the particle *zhi* 之), each of the lines is tetrasyllabic. The overall rhyme scheme is A–X, a–A–X–a, X–X–A, X–A, where A indicates words with *-eŋ vocalism (from the traditional *geng* 耕 rhyme group) and a indicates words with *-aŋ vocalism (from the traditional *yang* 陽 rhyme group). The highly regular phonetic pattern within these tetrasyllabic phrases is strikingly similar in structure to many poems anthologized in the *Classic of Poetry*, while the rhyming graphs in phrase-final position are also some of the most semantically important words in the speech: “standard” (*jing* 經 *kêŋ), “illumination” (*ming* 明 *mraŋ), “innate qualities” (*xing* 性 *seŋh) twice, “conduct” (*xing* 行 *grâŋ), and “notes” (*sheng* 聲 *hieŋ). Secondary to the rhymes, the graphs in the third position in each line also repeat, with *zhi* 之 *tə coming three times in the first five lines, then “five” (*wu* 五 *ŋâ?) four times in a row; *qi* 其 *gə, the final word in the third position, would have rhymed perfectly with *zhi*. The words that come in the first position of each line also tend to be semantically weighty, particularly the seven out of the eleven that end in nasals.

Taken in sum, the repetitive syntactic and phonetic patterning and high overall degree of regular euphony within this section provide an excellent example of how early Chinese orators used repetitive phonetic structures to emphasize certain terms and impart a sense of order and congruity within their rhetoric. As Zichan is describing the organization of the cosmos (a highly systematic representation of the powers of Heaven and Earth manifested in the

world), his use of repetitive, cadenced, and euphonic language was very likely a rhetorical tactic in which ordered speech is intentionally designed to mirror the organized patterns of the cosmos and to impart a sense of order to his audience.

Section 2: The lists that make up the midsection of Zitaishu's speech seem to have no discernable phonetic patterning until the final passage, which discusses "punishments and penalties" (*xing fa* 刑罰). From this point on, five of the final eight lines end in graphs featuring a final *-k, and the two longest lines feature a repeated pattern with a word featuring a final *-k two places before the phrase-final graph as well. Four of these words with *-k finals have negative connotations: "legal proceedings" (*yu* 獄 *ŋok), "lightning" (*yao* 曜 *liaukh), "[deadly] force" (*lu* 戮 *ruk), and "hatred" (*e* 惡 *ʔâkh); and three have positive connotations: "propagation" (*zhi* 殖 *dæk), "care" (*yu* 育 *luk), and "joy" (*le* 樂 *râuk). The initial five lines feature vowel disagreement, creating a *he yun* cross-rhymed pattern of consonance, but in the final three tetrasyllabic lines the first two form an initial couplet that would have rhymed perfectly or nearly perfectly (as "hatred" and "joy" feature analogous medial vowels followed by a *-k final and are both in the traditional *duo* 鐸 rhyme group).

Section 3: Despite the repetitive parallel grammatical structures that run through this section, the composer seems to have employed no discernable phonetic patterns or overt phonorhetorical devices. This is by no means atypical of these speeches; nonrhymed sections often separate passages exhibiting repetitive euphonic and other phonorhetorical devices.

Section 4: In the final section to the speech, there seems to be a resumption of the phonorhetorical device used in the opening section: the use of words featuring *-ŋ finals in phrase-final positions, as they occur in the outer two lines that frame the parallel tetrasyllabic lines ending in *ye* 也 in the middle of the passage. The metric structure is highly irregular, so the use of the semantically weighty words "commands" (*ling* 令 *rêŋ), "life" (*sheng* 生 *sreŋ), and "innate nature" (*xing* 性 *seŋh) in phrase-final position may simply have been to add further emphasis to these final phrases. Indeed, the opening line of the section ends in three words that potentially feature *-ŋ finals in succession (depending on the reconstruction): "instituting trustworthy commands" (*xing* 行 *grâŋ, *xin* 信 *sins/*s-niŋ-s [B], and *ling* 令 *rêŋ). As the phrase-final word "command" forms a perfect rhyme with "life" and "innate nature" (the frame rhymes of the inner parallel statements), this opening line would have likely lent a resonant sonority to this section and added further emphasis to the main topic in this passage.

A final note on the syntactically parallel phrases in the midsection of this passage is warranted. As noted above, the final graph in each of the four tetrasyllabic lines is a copula (*ye* 也 *laiʔ), and the word "thing" (*wu* 物 *mæt) occurs in the third position in both lines of the first couplet and in the second position in both lines of the second couplet. As these are precisely the same graphs

repeated in the same positions, while it does not necessarily make for good poetry, the euphonic and phonorhetorical power of this type of repetition would have been unmistakable and would likely have been the same regardless of what these words actually sounded like at the time. It bears noting that, in this final section, the lines that are not parallel contain the phonorhetorical device, perhaps representing an intentional tactic designed to set the two metrically and grammatically diverse parts to this final passage apart from each other and add emphasis to these lines, which otherwise would have been much less distinct.

In sum, in this speech Zitaishu employs both perfect rhyming using words with *-eŋ vocalism (from the traditional *geng* 耕 rhyme group) and *-aŋ vocalism (from the traditional *yang* 陽 rhyme group) in phrase-final position; words like “standard” (*jing* 經 *kêŋ), “conduct” (*xing* 行 *grâŋ), “illumination” (*ming* 明 *mrâŋ), “commands” (*ling* 令 *rêŋ), “life” (*sheng* 生 *sreŋ), and “inner nature” or “innate qualities” (*xing* 性 *seŋh). Then in section 2, patterns of cross-rhyme based on phrase-final words with *-k finals dominate; some have negative connotations, like “legal proceedings” (*yu* 獄 *ŋok), “lightning” (*yao* 曜 *liaukh), “[deadly] force” (*lu* 戮 *ruk), and “hatred” (*e* 惡 *âkh), but others have positive connotations: “propagation” (*zhi* 殖 *døk), “care” (*yu* 育 *luk), and “joy” (*le* 樂 *râuk). Many of his phonetically patterned lines are syntactically parallel and tetrasyllabic, and his third section contains no overt indication of rhyme whatsoever, so his use of phonorhetoric seems to have been targeted at the specific sections where he expounds upon cosmic phenomena and the “inner nature” or “innate qualities” of Earth and Heaven. Zitaishu displays his erudition and eloquence by using a combination of parallel grammatical and metric structures, words with deep and meaningful semantic connotations, and highly euphonic patterned language. He employs regular and repetitive phonorhetorical structures throughout his speech as a rhetorical tactic, reflecting an idealized systematic order of the cosmos in patterned literary expression.²⁶

Speech by Fu Chen in the “Duke Xi Twenty-Fourth Year” Chapter

The *Zuo Commentary* to the entry in the *Spring and Autumn Annals* for the “Xigong ershisinian zhuan” 僖公二十四年傳 (Duke Xi Twenty-Fourth Year; 636 BCE) records the events that preceded the attack on Zheng 鄭 by the Di 狄 listed in the *Annals*: King Xiang of Zhou 周襄王 (?–619 BCE) had recently interceded on the side of the small states of Wei 衛 and Hua 滑 against Zheng, which had invaded them and then withdrawn. Having protected Wei and Hua, the king was now debating about invading Zheng using a force made up primarily of Di warriors. The king’s adviser Fu Chen 富辰 (?–636 BCE) counsels against such an action, citing the long-standing ties between the Zhou royal house and the leaders of the state of Zheng, arguing that to turn their back on Zheng and ally with the Di was morally equivalent to a brother allying himself

with criminals and going to war against his brother. In the end, however, the king ignores Fu's argument and proceeds with the attack.

The dramatic quality of the scene is heightened by the repetitive phonorhetorical phrasing throughout the midsection of Fu Chen's long speech. Long prose sections that begin and end the speech bookend five short sections composed of rhyming prose featuring a variety of euphonic and rhetorical constructions, including a mix of phrase-final perfect rhyme, *he yun* cross-rhyme, repetitive and parallel rhetorical structures, and phrase-internal euphony based upon phrase-initial words or those that immediately precede a grammatical particle in phrase-final position.

Fu Chen's Speech in the "Duke Xi Twenty-Fourth Year" Chapter: Phonetics and Translation

Section 1: *Mise-en-scène, Speaker Named; Historical Narration, Quotes Classic of Poetry*

王 怒， 將 以 狄 伐 鄭。
*waj *nâh *tsaj *lɔʔ *lêk *bat *dɤŋh

The king was furious and was going to use the Di to invade Zheng.

富 辰 諫 曰，
*pəkh *dɔn *krâns *wat

Fu Chen remonstrated with him, saying,

「不 可。
*pə *khâiʔ

"This is not acceptable.

臣 聞 之，
*gin *mən *tə

Your servant has heard,

大²⁷ 上 以 德 撫 民，
*thâs *daŋh *lɔʔ *tôk *phaʔ *min

the highest technique uses virtue to soothe the people.

其 次 親 親，
*gə *tshih *tshin *tshin

The next best method is to favor one's relatives,

以 相 及 也。
*lɔʔ *saŋ *gəp *laiʔ

in order to reach others.

昔 周 公 弔 二 叔 之 不 咸，
*sak *tiu *klôŋ *tiâukh *nis *nhuk *tə *pə *grâm

In ancient times, the Duke of Zhou, aggrieved by the disharmony created by Guanshu and Caishu,

故 封 建 親 戚 以 蕃²⁸ 屏 周，
 *kâh *poŋ *kans *tshin *tshiùk *lǝ? *pan *bêŋ? *tiu
 thus enfeoffed his relatives [as rulers of smaller states] to thereby act as bulwarks for Zhou.

管、 蔡、 郕²⁹、 霍、 魯、 衛、
 *kôn *tsrets *deŋ *hwâk *rǝ? *wets
 [The rulers of] Guan, Cai, Cheng, Huo, Lu, Wei,

毛、 聃³⁰、 郤、 雍³¹、 曹、 滕、
 *mâu *nâm *kùkh *ʔoŋ *dzú *lôŋ
 Mao, Dan, Gao, Yong, Cao, Teng,

畢、 原、 酆³²、 郇³³、 文 之 昭 也。
 *pit *ŋwan *p(r)əm *swin *mən *tə *tiau *lai?
 Bì, Yuan, Feng, and Xun were all [King] Wen's sons.

邶³⁴、 晉、 應、 韓， 武 之 穆 也。
 *wa *tsins *ʔəŋ *gân *ma? *tə *muk *lai?
 Those of Yu, Jin, Ying, and Han were [King] Wu's progeny.

凡、 蔣³⁵、 邢、 茅³⁶、 胙³⁷、 祭³⁸、
 *bam *tsaŋ? *geŋ *mrú *dzâh *tsrêts
 Those of Fan, Jiang, Xing, Mao, Zuo, and Zhai

周 公 之 胤 也。
 *tiu *klôŋ *tə *lɔns *lai?
 were the Duke of Zhou's descendants.

召³⁹ 穆 公 思 周 德 之 不 類，
 *dauh *muk *klôŋ *sə *tiu *tâk *tə *pə *rus
 Duke Mu of Shao considered Zhou's virtue to be defective;

故 糾⁴⁰ 合 宗 族 于 成 周，
 *kâh *kiu? *gəp *tsùŋ *dzòk *wa *deŋ *tiu
 thus [he] assembled all the members of the lineage in Chengzhou,

而 作 詩， 曰：
 *nə *tsâk *lhə *wat
 and composed the poem that says:

『常 棣⁴¹ 之 華，
 *daŋ *rîs / lîs *tə *w(r)â
 'The flowers of the cherry tree,

鄂⁴² 不⁴³ 韡 韡⁴⁴。
 *ŋak *pə *wəi? *wəi?
 Are they not **truly splendid**?

凡 今 之 人，
 *bam *kəm *tə *nin
 Of men that now are,

莫 如 兄 弟。』
 *māk *na *hwraŋ *dāi?
 Nothing equals a **brother**.⁴⁵

其 四 章 曰，
 *gə *sis *taŋ *wat
 Its fourth stanza says:

『兄 弟 鬩⁴⁶ 于 牆，
 *hwraŋ *dāi? *hŋək *wa *dzaŋ
 ‘Brothers may quarrel within the walls,

外 禦⁴⁷ 其 侮⁴⁸。』
 *ŋwāts *ŋa? *gə *mo?
 But outside they defend one another from insult.”

Section 2: Remonstrance on Brotherhood

如 是，
 *na *de?
 “As such,

則 兄 弟 雖 有 小 忿⁴⁹，
 *tsək *hwraŋ *dāi? *swi *wə? *siau? *phəns
 though brothers may have **petty resentments**,

不 廢 懿 親，
 *pə *pats *ʔits *tshin
 [they] will not disregard their closest **kin**.

今 天 子 不 忍 小 忿，
 *kəm *thín *tsə? *pə *nən? *siau? *phəns
 Now, Your Majesty, unable to bear **petty resentments**,

以 棄 鄭 親，
 *lə? *khi(t)s *dreŋh *tshin
thereby discards Zheng’s **kinship**,

其 若 之 何？
 *gə *nak *tə *gài
 what is **this** like?”

Section 3: The Greatest Virtues, Evils, and Calamities

庸 勳 親 親，
 *loŋ *hwən *tshin *tshin
 “Employing the **meritorious**, fostering close kinship with one’s **kin**,

暱⁵⁰ 近 尊 賢，
 *nrək *gəns *tsûn *gîn
 keeping close ties with **those near at hand**, revering the **worthy**:

德 之 大 者 也。
 *tâk *tə *dâs *ta? *lai?
 these are the greatest of virtues.

即 聾⁵¹, 從 昧⁵²,
 *tsit *rõŋ *dzõŋ *mâs
 Approaching the **deaf** and following the blind,

與 頑, 用 瞽⁵³,
 *la? *grôn *loŋh *græn / *grin
 joining with the **wayward** and employing the **stupid**:

茲 之 大 者 也。
 *krân *tə *dâs *ta? *lai?
 these are greatest of evils.

棄 德 崇 姦,
 *khits *tâk *dzruŋ *krân
 Discarding virtue and honoring **evil**,

禍 之 大 者 也,
 *gôŋ? *tə *dâs *ta? *lai?
 this is the greatest of calamities.”

Section 4: Zheng Is Our Close Ally

鄭 有 平 惠 之 勳,
 *dreŋh *wə? *breŋ *wis *tə *hwân
 “Zheng performed **meritorious service** for [kings] Ping and Hui,

又 有 厲 宣 之 親,
 *wəh *wə? *rats *swan *tə *tshin
 and **was as kin** to [Zhou kings] Li and Xuan;

棄 嬖 寵 而 用 三 良,
 *khits *pêkh *rhoŋ? *nə *loŋh *sêm *raŋ
 [Zheng] discarded its favored heirs and [instead] has been employing the ‘three **good ministers**’;

於 諸 姬 為 近,
 *ʔa *ta *kə *wai *gəns
 of all the states ruled by the Ji clan it is **closest** [to us],

四 德 具 矣。
 *sis *tâk *goh *lə?
 the four virtues it possesses completely.”

Section 5: Parallel Statements on Moral Character

耳 不 聽 五 聲 之 和 為 聾,
 *nə? *pə *lhêŋ *ŋâ? *hieŋ *tə *wâi *wai *rõŋ
 “He whose ear does not hear the harmony of the five sounds is **deaf**;

目 不 別⁵⁴ 五 色 之 章 為 昧,
 *muk *pə *prat *ŋǎ? *srək *tə *taŋ *wai *mâts
 he whose eye does not distinguish the hues of the five colors is blind;

心 不 則 德 義 之 經 為 頑,
 *səm *pə *tsək *tək *ŋaih *tə *kəŋ *wai *ŋrôn
 he whose mind does not accord with the principles of virtue and righteousness is **wayward**;

口 不 道 忠 信 之 言 為 𪛗。
 *khó? *pə *lú? *truŋ *sin *tə *ŋan *wai *ŋrən / *ŋrin
 he whose mouth does not speak the words of loyalty and faith is a **stupid chatterer**.”

Section 6: The Di Are Evil, Not like the Zhou

狄 皆 則 之,
 *dék *krî *tsək *tə
 “The Di all take **this** as a model,

四 姦 具 矣。
 *sis *krân *goh *lǎ?
 the four evils they possess **completely**.

周 之 有 懿 德 也,
 *tiu *tə *wə? *ŋits *tək *lai? / *laj? (B)
 [When] Zhou had admirable virtue,

猶 曰 莫 如 兄 弟,
 *ju *wat *mâk *na *hwraŋ *dǎi? / *fəj? (B)
 it was still said that ‘Nothing equals a **brother**’;

故 封 建 之。
 *kâh *poŋ *kans *tə
 and thus, [the Zhou] enfeoffed **them**.”

Section 7: To Follow the Di Would Be “the Way of All Evil”

其 懷 柔 天 下 也,
 *gə *grûi *nu *thîn *gra? *lai?
 “While [Zhou] was gently cherishing all under Heaven,

猶 懼 有 外 侮;
 *ju *gwakh *wə? *ŋwâts *mo?
 it was still afraid there would be insult from outside;

扞 禦 侮 者,
 *gâns *ŋa? *mo? *ta?
 to defend against and resist insulters,

莫 如 親 親,
 *mâk *na *tshin *tshin
 nothing equals fostering close kinship with one’s **kin**,

故 以 親 屏 周。
 *kâh *lǝʔ *tshin *bêŋ *tiu
 thus [Zhou] thereby made its relatives a bulwark to its domains.

召 穆 公 亦 云。
 *dauh *muk *klõŋ *jak *wən
 Duke Mu of Shao also **stated this**.

今 周 德 既 衰,
 *kəm *tiu *tâk *kəs *srui
 Now, Zhou's virtue has already declined;

於 是 乎 又 渝⁵⁵ 周 召,
 *ʔa *deʔ *fiâ *wəh *lo *tiu *dauh
 at this point, moving further from [the ways of] Zhou and Shao,

以 從 諸 姦,
 *lǝʔ *dzon *ta *krân
 in order to follow the many **evils**,

無 乃 不 可 乎!
 *ma *nǝʔ *pə *khâiʔ *fiâ
 surely this is unacceptable!

民 未 忘 禍,
 *min *məs *maŋ *gõiʔ
 The people have not yet forgotten [recent] calamities,

王 又 興 之,
 *waŋ *wəh *həŋ *tə
 [and you] king, further arouse them;

其 若 文 武 何 ? 』
 *gə *nak *mən *maʔ *gâi
 how is this like [the ways of kings] Wen and Wu?"

Section 8: Zuo Narrative Resumes, the King Joins with the Di and Attacks Zheng

王 弗 聽,
 *waŋ *pət *lhêŋh
 The king did not listen to this advice

使 頽⁵⁶ 叔、 桃⁵⁷ 子 出 狄 師。
 *srəʔ *dúi *nhuk *lâu *tsəʔ *k-hluts *dék *sri
 and dispatched Tui Shu and Tao Zi to send out the Di army.

Section 1: The opening narrative section to this speech provides the background for Fu Chen's remonstrance: the Zhou king wishes to ally the royal army with the Di and use them to attack the neighboring state of Zheng. Fu Chen openly disagrees with him and provides historical examples of the use of virtue (*de* 德) and kinship (*qin* 親) to both foster harmony within the state and

support the alliances with other states that served as bulwarks against outside aggressors. As support for his argument that the tradition of strong familial ties between states should be maintained, at the very end of this long prose section Fu quotes two lines from the poem “Cherry Tree” 常棣 (Changdi) from the “Lesser Odes” 小雅 (Xiaoya) section of the *Classic of Poetry*. The quotation from the poem is the first instance in this speech featuring phonetic patterning, and it seems to serve as a formal prelude to the cadenced, repetitive phonorhetorical lines that make up the midsection of the speech. Interestingly, the first citation that Fu quotes is an entire stanza composed of four tetrasyllabic, perfectly rhyming lines in an XAXA format. The second citation, taken from the fourth stanza of the poem, contains only the opening two nonrhyming lines. This second example is by far the most typical method in which quotes from the *Classic of Poetry* are employed in the *Zuo Commentary*, selected primarily on the basis of their semantic and historical relevance and connotations; entire rhyming stanzas are provided only in rare instances, and lines quoted from the *Classic of Poetry* generally do not rhyme and are not employed as phonorhetorical devices.

Section 2: In the second section, Fu employs paired parallel lines for rhetorical effect, similar in construction to some early Chinese aphorisms. The meter is repeated, as are the final graph(s) in each line: a heptasyllabic line ending in “petty resentments” (*xiao fen* 小忿 *siau? *phən?) is followed by a tetrasyllabic line ending in “affection” (*qin* 親 *tshin), and after this structure is repeated, the fifth line ends the section in a nonrhyming tetrasyllabic rhetorical question. As the vowels are different in the two phrase-final graphs, they do not constitute true rhyme, but as Wang Li 王力 (1900–1986) noted in *Shi jing yun du* 詩經韻讀 (Rhymes in the *Classic of Poetry*), there are examples in the *Classic of Poetry* of cross-rhyming using these two rhyme groups (*fen* 忿 *phən? is in the traditional *zhen* 真 rhyme group, and *qin* 親 *tshin is in the traditional *wen* 文 rhyme group), so they would very possibly have been phonetically proximate enough to constitute a rhyme in this case.⁵⁸ This type of *he yun* consonance is common among the texts detailed in this study; regardless of whether or not these are true rhymes, their phonetic effect cannot be ignored. Finally, the initial graphs in the second and fourth lines of this section also underscore the parallel syntactic constructions: the finals of the graphs *bu* 不 *pə and *yi* 以 *lə? are echoed in the first and third graphs of the final tetrasyllabic line, *qi* 其 *gə and *zhi* 之 *tə, producing a subtle repetitive phonorhetorical effect.

Section 3: This section comprises three short comments, each of which ends with a nonrhyming concluding line stating “these are the greatest of X” (*X zhi da zhe ye* 之大者也). The first two lines form a disyllabic AaAa rhyming couplet with the phrase-final rhyme words “meritorious” (*xun* 勳 *hwən) and “near” (*jin* 近 *gəns) paired with “kin” (*qin* 親 *tshin) and “worthy” (*xian* 賢 *gīn),

respectively. More intriguing is the use of the word “blind” (*mei* 昧 *mêts) in the second couplet (and again in phrase-final position in section 5): Lu Deming 陸德明 (ca. 550–630) clearly indicates it is to be pronounced as *mei* 妹, so this cannot be construed as a rhyme; it seems to be an AXaα cross-rhyming disyllabic structure. The cross-rhymes in these lines do potentially indicate a phonetic correspondence among “deaf” (*long* 聾 *rôn, in the traditional *dong* 東 rhyme group), “wayward” (*wan* 頑 *ŋrôn, in the traditional *yuan* 元 rhyme group), and “stupid chatterer” (*yin* 瞢 *ŋrən or *ŋrin, in the traditional *zhen* 真 rhyme group), and these passages seem to evidence a practice of near-rhyming using words with proximate vowels followed by proximate nasal consonants; that said, it is important to note that, according to Wang Li, no cross-rhymes involving these three rhyme groups are evidenced in the *Classic of Poetry*.

Section 4: In this short section Fu’s phonorhetorical structure changes again, as we are presented with four lines of six, six, seven, and five graphs each in an AaαA rhyme scheme; similar to the previous section, the *he yun* cross-rhyming words that fall in phrase-final position employ nasal final consonants, “intimate” (*qin* 親 *tshin) and “good men” (*liang* 良 *raŋ), and provide another example of phrase-final end-consonant consonance. Also similar to the patterns in this and the other texts in this study is the use of a final, nonrhyming line in this section, which seems to function as a type of coda and summation of Fu’s argument.

Section 5: This short section provides the most striking parallel rhetorical construction in the speech, comprising four lines of nine graphs each, in which the second, sixth, and eighth words are the same in each line, forming the repeated syntactic pattern: “The [body part] which does not [verb of the sensory function of the body part] [four-graph ‘XX of Y’ attributive phrase] is [negative adjective].” In terms of euphony, these four lines seem to form a cross-rhyming aXαA stanza featuring the phrase-final words “deaf” (*long* 聾 *C.r̥on), “wayward” (*wan* 頑 *ŋrôn), and “stupid chatterer” (*yin* 瞢 *ŋrən or *ŋrin); as noted above, “blind” (*mei* 昧 *mêts) does not seem to form part of the phonetic pattern.

Section 6: This is the final section of the speech that employs obvious phonetic patterning, but here the patterns diverge from the phonetic structures in the other sections. When using Schuessler’s reconstructions, the five lines that comprise this section fall into an AABbA metric pattern of 4–4–6–6–4 graphs per line, wherein the first, second, and fifth tetrasyllabic lines rhyme perfectly with each other while the inner hexasyllabic lines do not cross-rhyme with the tetrasyllabic lines. The passage seems to evidence an intriguing type of phonorhetorical device: with the exception of the fourth line, which is a direct quote taken from the *Classic of Poetry*, the phrase-final words are all particles (*zhuci* 助詞) rather than words with significant semantic weight; the

tetrasyllabic lines end in *zhi* 之 *tə in the first and fifth lines, and *yi* 矣 *qə? ends the second line. In the *Classic of Poetry*, these particles normally form disyllabic rhyming patterns where the main rhyme word precedes the particle, but this is clearly not the case here. In the inner sextasyllabic couplet, the emphatic particle *ye* 也 *lai? potentially forms a cross-rhyme with the word “brothers” (*di* 弟 *dêi?) at the end of the quote. Wang Li noted in his *Shi jing yun du* that in one example from the *Classic of Poetry* a *ge* 歌 rhyme group word cross-rhymes with a *zhi* 脂 rhyme group word, so these two lines were very possibly phonetically proximate enough to form an interior cross-rhyming sextasyllabic couplet, as they clearly diverge from the exterior frame in metric length, grammar, and phrase-final phonetics.⁵⁹

Sections 7 and 8: As far as I can discern, there are no obvious further attempts at phonetic patterning throughout the rest of Fu Chen’s speech. This section serves as a reiteration of the arguments he has presented, focusing on historical precedent and warning against turning his back on his relatives to ally the royal house with foreigners of low moral character. In this final line, the narrator of the *Zuo Commentary* notes that the king does not heed Fu’s advice and sends two of his high-ranking officers along with the army of the Di to attack Zheng. This stratagem will have positive short-term effects (Zheng is defeated) yet disastrous long-term ramifications, as the Di will thereafter turn on the Zhou king and overthrow the royal capital, and Fu’s eloquent words of warning will be proved accurate. This follows the general emplotment of the *Zuo Commentary*, in which the exquisitely crafted rhetoric of noble men is consistently disregarded by their superiors, with inevitably disastrous results. These eloquent orations thus include connotations of both sageliness and tragedy, dramatic renderings of the degraded times in which no good counselor can get a fair hearing, leaving it to the reader coming centuries after the events to recollect and fully appreciate the perspicuity of these speeches and to choose more wisely when presented with a similar situation.

Fu Chen’s remonstrance employs sections of patterned speech between long prose sections, a form not unlike that employed by the composers of speeches in previous eras, featuring phrase-final words and phrases like “kin [ship]” (*qin* 親 *tshin), “good men” (*liang* 良 *raŋ), and “petty resentments” (*xiao fen* 小忿 *siau? *phən?), and even a potential example of phrase-initial rhyming.⁶⁰ His repeated use of parallel grammatical and rhetorical structures (particularly in the aphorisms) and emphasis on perfect rhyme seem to indicate a more refined style than that employed in the Western Zhou bronze inscriptions or the *Classic of Documents*; while there are discernable patterns of *he yun* consonance among the final consonants in these sections, vowel harmony seems to be more consistently employed here. While this could be due to a lack of

Key
-ŋ 合韻 cross-rhyme
-ŋ 押韻 perfect rhyme
-n 合韻 cross rhyme
-n 押韻 perfect rhyme
-k 合韻 cross-rhyme
-j 合韻 cross-rhyme
-ai 押韻 perfect rhyme
-ai 押韻 perfect rhyme
-ə 押韻 perfect rhyme
-a 押韻 perfect rhyme
-i 押韻 perfect rhyme
-t 合韻 cross-rhyme
-u 押韻 perfect rhyme

Chungking Zuo zhuan: Speech by Fu Chen 富辰 in the
"Duke Xi 24th Year" Chapter 《春秋左傳·僖公二十四年傳》

王怒，將以狄伐鄭。
*wəŋ *tʰuɪ *tʰuŋ *lɿʔ *hɪk *tʰu *dʌŋh
The king was furious and was going to use the Di to invade Zheng.

富辰諫曰：
*pəkh *dʌn *kʰrɪm *wut
Fu Chen remonstrated with him, saying,
「不可。」
*pə *kʰhiʔ
"This is not acceptable."
服問之，
*gɪn *mɔn *tɿ
Your servant has heard,
大上以摯撫民。
*tʰis *dʌŋh *lɿʔ *tɿk *pʰaʔ *mɪn
the highest technique uses virtue to soothe the people.

其父視親，
*gə *tʰshh *tʰshɪn *tʰuɪn
The next best method is to favor one's relatives,
以相及也。
*lɿʔ *səŋ *gəp *lɿʔ
in order to reach others.

魯閔公弑二叔之不咸，
*sək *tʰuɪ *kʰlɔŋ *tʰiəkh *mɪs *tʰuək *tɿ *pə *grɪn
In ancient times, the Duke of Zhou, aggrieved by the disharmony created by Guanhu and Caishu,
故封建親戚以蕃屏周。
*kʰtʰ *pəŋ *kʌns *tʰshɪk *lɿʔ *pʌn *bʰɛŋʔ *tʰiɪ
thus enfeoffed his relatives [as rulers of smaller states] to thereby act as bulwarks for Zhou.

晉、鄭、邲、鄭、翟、鄭、衛。
*kʰɔn *tʰɛrɛts *dʌŋ *tʰwɪk *rɿʔ *wɛts
[The rulers of] Guan, Cai, Cheng, Hao, Lu, Wei,
毛、明、鄭、鄭、鄭、鄭、鄭。
*mɪs *nɪm *kʰtʰk *ʔɔŋ *dʌi *lɿŋ
Mao, Dun, Gao, Yong, Cao, Teng,
畢、畢、鄭、鄭、文之昭也。
*pɪt *ŋwɛn *pʰɪrɪm *bʰɛn *wɛn *mɔn *tɿ *tʰiɪn *lɿʔ
Bi, Yuan, Feng, and Xun were all [King] Wen's sons.

邢、晉、鄭、鄭、武之穆也。
*wɛ *tʰɪns *ʔɛŋ *gʰɔn *mɿʔ *tɿ *tʰuɪk *lɿʔ
Those of Yu, Jin, Ying, and Han were [King] Wu's progeny.

凡、黃、邢、鄭、茅、鄭、鄭。
*hɪn *tʰɛŋʔ *tʰɛŋ *tʰɪn *mɪs *tʰshɪk *tʰɛts
Those of Fan, Jiang, Xing, Mao, Zuo, and Zhai
閔公之胤也。
*tʰiɪ *kʰlɔŋ *tɿ *tʰɪns *lɿʔ
were the Duke of Zhou's descendants.

召穆公思周之不韙，
*dʌsh *mʉk *kʰlɔŋ *sɿ *tʰiɪ *tɿk *tɿ *pə *rʉs
Duke Mu of Shao considered Zhou's virtue to be defective.
故糾合宗族于成周，
*kʰh *kʰiʔ *gəp *tʰuɪn *dʌk *wɛ *dɛŋ *tʰiɪ
thus [he] assembled all the members of the lineage in Chengzhou,
而作詩，曰：
*tʰuɪ *tʰɪk *tʰɪɪ *wɛt
and composed the poem that says:
「棠棣之華，
*dʌŋ *rɪtʰ / tʰɪs *tɿ *wɛ(r)ʰ
The flowers of the cherry tree,
都不與諱。」
*ŋɪk *pə *wɛ(r)ʰ *wɛʔ
Are they not truly splendid?

凡今之人，
*hɪn *kʰɛn *tɿ *mɪn
Of men that now are,
無兄弟，
*mɪk *mɪ *hɛrɪŋ *dʌiʔ
Nothing equals a brother.
其四章曰：
*gə *tʰɪs *tʰɪɪ *wɛt
Its fourth stanza says:
「兄弟鬩于牆，
*hɛrɪŋ *dʌiʔ *hɛpɪk *wɛ *dʌŋ
"Brothers may quarrel within the walls,
外禦其侮。」
*ŋwɪts *ŋɪʔ *pə *mʉʔ
But outside they defend one another from insult."'
如是，
*mɪ *dɛʔ
"As such,

Figure 1. Visualization of phonetic devices in the *Zuo Commentary*

Figure 1. *continued*

<p>為九歌，八風，七音，六律， *wai *ku? *kai? *pət? *pəm? *tshit? *ʔəm? *ruk? *nət? There were made the nine songs, the eight airs, the seven tones, and the six pitches,</p> <p>以奉五聲。 *lo? *bo? *gə? *gə? *hɛy? to uphold the five notes.</p> <p>為君臣上下， *wai *kwən? *gin? *dunh? *grə? There were made rulers and ministers, high and low,</p> <p>以明地道。 *lo? *tək? *läh? *gəh? in order to model Earth's righteousness.</p> <p>為夫婦內外， *wai *pa? *ho? *pəks? *nəts? There were made husbands and wives, interiority (=the home) and exteriority (=the outside world),</p> <p>以緒二物。 *lo? *kɛŋ? *nis? *mət? /*C.mət? (B) in order to regulate these two spheres.</p> <p>為父子，兄弟，姑姊。 *wai *hə? *tə? *həwəp? *dai? *kə? *tə? There were made fathers and sons, elder brothers and younger brothers, aunts and sisters,</p> <p>聘親，昏媾，姻亞。 *sreŋ? *gə? *hməis? *kəb? *ʔən? *ʔrəkh? maternal uncles and aunts, relations by marriage, and in-laws,</p> <p>以象天明。 *lo? *əjan? *tshin? *mən? in order to provide a semblance for Heaven's illumination.</p> <p>為政事，施力，行務。 *wai *təp? *sə? *sə? *lən? *tək? *gəp? *məh? There were made government and administration, services and works, actions and measures,</p> <p>以從四時。 *lo? *dzoŋ? *sɪs? *də? in order to accord with the four seasons.</p> <p>為刑罰威獄。 *wai *gəp? *bat? *ʔu? *gək? There were made punishments and penalties, and the awesome power of legal proceedings,</p> <p>世民畏忌。 *sə? *mɪn? *ʔu? *gəh? causing the people to be awestruck and fearful,</p> <p>以類其雷霆震怒。 *lo? *tɪs? *gə? *təns? *hənk? *sɪt? *rək? in order to simulate the deadly forces of thunder and lightning.</p> <p>為溫慈惠和。 *wai *ʔu? *dɪs? *wɛi? *wəi? There were made mildness and gentleness, kindness and harmony,</p> <p>以效天之生殖，長育。 *lo? *gəh? *tshin? *tə? *sreŋ? *dək? *dzoŋ? *tək? in order to imitate Heaven's propagation and long-lasting care.</p> <p>民有怨惡。 *mɪn? *wə? *hə? *ʔəkh? The people had love and hatred.</p> <p>喜怒哀樂。 *ho? *nəh? *ʔəi? *rək? delight and anger, grief and joy,</p> <p>生於六氣。 *sreŋ? *wə? *tək? *khas? produced by the six ethers."</p> <p>是故審則宜難。 *de? *kəh? *həŋ? *tək? *gəi? *rɪn? "This is the reason why we take care to imitate what is proper and suitable,</p> <p>以制六志。 *lo? *təs? *tək? *təh? in order to regulate the six passions.</p> <p>哀有哭泣。 *ʔəi? *wə? *khək? *khrəp? To grief belongs crying and tears;</p> <p>樂有歌舞。 *rlək? *wə? *kəi? *mə? to joy belongs song and dance;</p> <p>喜有宴會。 *ho? *wə? *həi? *hə? to delight belongs bestowal and forgiveness;</p> <p>怒有戰鬥。 *nəh? *wə? *təns? *doh? to anger belongs conflict and struggle.</p> <p>喜生於好。 *ho? *sreŋ? *ʔə? *həh? Delight is born of love,</p> <p>怒生於惡。 *nəh? *sreŋ? *ʔə? *ʔəkh? anger is born of hatred."</p>	<p>則兄弟雖有小忿。 *tək? *həwəp? *dai? *wəi? *wə? *sɪn? *pəns? [though] brothers may have petty resentments,</p> <p>亦直親親。 *po? *pəns? *ʔis? *tshin? [they] will not disregard their closest kin.</p> <p>今天子不忍小忿。 *kəm? *tshin? *tə? *po? *nən? *sɪn? *pəns? Now, Your Majesty, unable to bear petty resentments,</p> <p>以親鄭親。 *lo? *khit? *tɪs? *dzoŋh? *tshin? thereby discards Zheng's kinship,</p> <p>其若之何? *pa? *tək? *tə? *gəi? what is this like?"</p> <p>則親親親。 *tək? *həwəp? *tshin? *tshin? "Employing the meritorious, fostering close kinship with one's kin,</p> <p>則親親親。 *tək? *gəns? *tshin? *gin? keeping close ties with those near at hand, revering the worthy;</p> <p>德之大者也。 *tək? *tə? *dɪs? *tə? *tə? these are the greatest of virtues.</p> <p>即聾，從昧。 *təi? *rəŋ? *dzoŋ? *məh? Approaching the deaf and following the blind,</p> <p>則頑，用愚。 *lo? *gəh? *lən? *lən? *gəp? /*gəp? joining with the wayward and employing the stupid;</p> <p>茲之大者也。 *kən? *tə? *dɪs? *tə? *tə? these are the greatest of evils.</p> <p>無德崇焉。 *khit? *tək? *dzoŋ? *krən? Discarding virtue and honoring evil.</p> <p>禍之大者也。 *gəi? *tə? *dɪs? *tə? *tə? this is the greatest of calamities."</p> <p>鄭有平惠之勳。 *dzoŋh? *wə? *həŋ? *wɛi? *tə? *həwəp? "Zheng performed meritorious service for [kings] Ping and Hui,</p> <p>又有厲宣之親。 *wəh? *wə? *təns? *wəwəp? *təh? and was as kin to [Zhou kings] Li and Xuan,</p> <p>無難寵而用三良。 *khit? *pəh? *həŋ? *tə? *lən? *sɪn? *rəŋ? [Zheng] discarded his favored heirs and [instead] has been employing the 'three good ministers';</p> <p>於諸侯為近。 *ʔə? *tə? *kə? *wəi? *gəns? of all the states ruled by the Ji clan it is closest [to us].</p> <p>四德具矣。 *sɪs? *tək? *gəh? *lo? the four virtues it possesses completely."</p> <p>耳不聞五聲之和為聾。 *nə? *po? *lən? *gəi? *həŋ? *tə? *wəi? *wəi? *rəŋ? "he whose ear does not hear the harmony of the five sounds is deaf;</p> <p>目不別五色之章為昧。 *tək? *po? *pəi? *gəi? *səh? *tə? *lən? *wəi? *məh? he whose eye does not distinguish the hues of the five colors is blind;</p> <p>心不則德義之經為頑。 *sən? *po? *tək? *tək? *gəh? *tə? *kəŋ? *wəi? *gəh? he whose mind does not accord with the principles of virtue and righteousness is wayward,</p> <p>口不道忠信之言為嚚。 *kəh? *po? *hə? *rəŋ? *sɪn? *tə? *gəp? *wəi? *gəp? /*gəp? he whose mouth does not speak the words of loyalty and faith is a stupid chatterer."</p> <p>狄晉用之。 *dik? *kɪ? *tək? *tə? "The Di all take this as a model,</p> <p>鄭亦具矣。 *sɪs? *kɪn? *gəh? *tə? the four evils they possess completely.</p> <p>周之有懿德也。 *tɪn? *tə? *wə? *ʔən? *tək? *təi? /*təi? (B) [When] Zhou had admirable virtue,</p> <p>猶曰莫如兄弟。 *ju? *wəi? *məh? *tə? *həwəp? *dai? /*təi? (B) it was still said that "Nothing equals a brother,"</p> <p>故封建之。 *kəh? *pəp? *kəns? *tə? and thus, [the Zhou] enforced them."</p>
---	---

Figure 1. continued

是故通行德令。 *de? *k'ih *həu? *grāg *sins / *saiŋgə (H) *r'gh "For this reason we must take care in instituting trustworthy commands, (行) 禍福賞罰。 (*grāg) *gōi? *p'ak *hjaŋ? *bət (instituting) calamity and blessings, rewards and punishments, 以和死生。 *is? *t'atə *s'i? *s'req in order to regulate death and life. 生，好物也。 *s'req *h'āh *mat *h'i? Life is a good thing. 死，惡物也。 *s'i? *z'āh *mat *h'i? death is an evil thing. 好物，樂也。 *h'āh *mat *r'ak *h'i? Good things are joyous, 惡物，哀也。 *r'āh *mat *r'āi *h'i? evil things are sorrowful. 哀樂不失。 *r'āi *r'ak *pə *h'it When sorrow and joy are not lost. 乃東顧于天地之性。 *nə? *n'āh *g'ip *wə *h'ih *d'eh *tə *r'əp then one can be in harmony with Heaven and Earth's innate nature. 是以長久。 *de? *is? *d'raŋ *k'we?	其懷柔天下也。 *gə *gr'ui *nu *h'ih *grə? *h'i? "While [Zhou] was gently cherishing all under Heaven, 猶懼有外侮。 *ju *g'wəh *wə? *g'w'is *mō? it was still afraid there would be insult from outside, 汗栗假若。 *g'is *gə? *mō? *h'i? to defend against and resist insulters, 姑勿親親。 *m'ik *mə *h'ih *h'ih nothing equals fostering close kinship with one's kin, 故以親屏藩。 *g'ih *h'i? *h'ih *b'ēŋ *t'iu thus [Zhou] thereby made its relatives a bulwark to its domains. 召穆公亦云。 *d'auh *m'uk *k'loŋ *jak *wən Duke Mu of Shao also stated this. 今周德既衰。 *k'əm *t'iu *t'ak *k'as *r'ui Now, Zhou's virtue has already declined; 於是乎又逾厲召。 *tə *de? *r'āi *w'ah *lō *t'iu *d'auh at this point, moving further from [the ways of] Zhou and Shao, 以從諸姦。 *h'i? *d'auŋ *t'ā *r'ān in order to follow the many evils, 無乃不可乎！ *m'ə *nə? *pə *k'h'i? *r'āi surely this is unacceptable! 民未忘禍。 *m'ih *m'as *m'ag *g'ōi? The people have not yet forgotten [recent] calamities, 王又興之。 *w'ag *w'ah *h'āŋ *tə [and you] king, further arouse them, 甚若文武何？ *gə *n'ak *m'ən *m'ə? *g'āi how is this like [the ways of kings] Wen and Wu?" 王弗聽。 *w'ag *p'at *h'ih The king did not listen to this advice. 使嬖倖、桃季出狄師。 *s'ra? *d'āi *n'ak *l'āi *nə? *k'h'is *d'ik *s'i and dispatched Tui Shu and Tao Zi to send out the Di army.
--	--

understanding of vowel shifts in the language of the time (and thus these would all have been perfect rhymes to the ear of the composer), it could also represent a conscious stylistic choice. Fu also alternates among disyllabic, tetrasyllabic, and mixed-meter rhyming in his couplets; as he quotes the *Classic of Poetry* twice in his remarks, he could be actively using the syntactic and phonetic patterns established in that text as a guideline for his speech rather than relying on Western Zhou models of rhetoric and oratory.

Despite the fact that the great Qing phonologists included passages from the *Zuo Commentary* in their studies of Chinese linguistics and literature, it bears repeating that no previous scholar has adduced any form of phonetic patterning or phonorhetorical devices for the two speeches in this study presented above. Given the regular parallel and metrically regular phrasing, the high overall degree of euphony, and the sheer number of phonetic structures and devices they exhibit (see fig. 1), these passages provide a few specific examples of how ancient Chinese orators used highly patterned language and “artistic prose” to emphasize key terms, to express deep truths, and to persuade others.

Examples of Phonetic Patterns, Euphony, and Phonorhetoric in Selected Speeches from the *Discourses of the States*

A sister text to the *Zuo Commentary*, the *Discourses of the States* also features a number of long and eloquent speeches by royal ministers and high officials.⁶¹ Viewed in comparison with the *Zuo Commentary*, the *Discourses* has one particularly intriguing attribute: while the *Zuo Commentary* contains sporadic phonorhetorical patterning scattered throughout all of its chapters, the results of this research have shown that in the *Discourses* only one chapter features regular use of euphony and phonorhetorical devices: the latter half of the “Discourses of Yue” 越語下 (Yueyu xia).⁶²

While lower profile than the *Zuo Commentary*, the use of rhyme and euphony in the *Discourses of the States* has received some attention from both premodern and modern scholars, and some of the rhymes and rhyme words in this section were noted by the eminent Qing phonologists. Just as with the *Zuo Commentary*, however, no scholar has previously produced a comprehensive analysis of phonetic patterning in any passage or phonorhetorical analyses analogous to those featured below. Included below are two representative dialogues, each containing long speeches by the official Fan Li 范蠡 (536–448 BCE) to the king of Yue, with Axel Schuessler’s reconstructed pronunciations for each graph in sequence to allow for direct comparative analyses with the speeches from the *Zuo Commentary* in the previous section.

Third Dialogue between Fan Li and the King of Yue in the Latter “Discourses of Yue” Chapter

The latter “Discourses of Yue” chapter comprises a series of dialogues between the high minister Fan Li and the king of Yue, mainly on the subject of going to war with the kingdom of Wu 吳. Fan was sent to Wu as an official diplomatic envoy, and after three years he is sent back to Yue. Upon his return, he is summoned to court to discuss diplomatic and military options with the king, consistently employing language and metaphors taken from the Taoist tradition to frame his opinions on good government and how one should correctly use the kingdom’s resources and military force. At the end of the first dialogue presented below, Fan’s ministrations are ostensibly successful, and the king agrees to implement Fan’s plan and not to attack Wu immediately but to bide his time.

The two speeches that comprise most of the dialogue have been split into three sections below. Each speech contains several short sections featuring mainly perfectly rhymed phrase-final words in highly regular metric patterns; there are also three passages that employ *he yun* cross-rhymes and a few places where the metric pattern is slightly irregular. There are also two separate examples of couplets that employ a form of double rhyme well known from the *Classic of Poetry* (the second-to-last graphs rhyme and then the rhyming graph

is followed by the final particle *zhi* 之), and in the perfectly rhymed sections, five different rhyme groups are employed. Overall, in the fifty-nine lines in this first example, thirty-six (61 percent) evidence the use of some form of rhyme or *he yun* cross-rhyme between phrase-final graphs (twenty-two perfect rhyming and fourteen cross-rhyming), lending a highly cadenced and euphonic quality to Fan's arguments.

Third Dialogue between Fan Li and the King of Yue in the Latter "Discourses of Yue" Chapter: Phonetics and Translation

Section 1: Fan Li Returns from Wu and Exhorts the King to Follow the "Unchanging Laws" of Heaven and Earth

三 年,
*sóm *nín
Three years passed,

而 吳 人 遣 之。
*nə *ŋwâ *nín *khen? *tə
and the people of Wu sent him [= Fan Li] back.

歸 及 至 于 國,
*kwəi *gəp *tits *wa *kwək
He returned home and then went to the capital.

王 問 于 范 蠡 曰:
*waj *məns *wa *bam? *rê? *wat
The king asked Fan Li about it [= his mission to Wu], saying:

「節 事 奈 何 ? 」
*tsît *s-rə? *nâs *gâi
"How did the 'managing of affairs' go?"

對 曰:
*tûts *wat
[Fan] replied, saying:

「節 事 者 與 地。
*tsît *s-rə? *ta? *la? *lâih
"With the 'managing of affairs,' it all depends on the Earth.

唯 地 能 包 萬 物 以 為 一,
*wi *draih *nəŋ *prû *mans *mət *lə? *wai *ʔit
So it is that the Earth encompasses the ten thousand things and takes them as **one**,

其 事 不 失。
*gə *s-rə? *pə *lhīt
and it carries out its missions without **fail**.

生 萬 物, 容 畜⁶³ 禽 獸,
*sreŋ *mans *mət *loŋ *rhuk *gəm *hjuh
[The Earth] gives birth to the ten thousand things, contains and nurtures the birds and beasts,

然 後 受 其 名 而 兼 其 利。
 *nan *fió? *du? *gə *meŋ *nə *kêm(s) *gə *rih / *C.rit-s (B)
 it thereby receives its reputation and is impartial in its **benefits**.

美 惡 皆 成,
 *mui? *ʔâk *kri *deŋ
 Both good and evil [fortune] are brought to **completion**,

以 養 其 生。
 *lǝ? *jaŋ? *gə *sreŋ
 thereby nourishing its **creation**.

時 不 至, 不 可 強 (彊) ⁶⁴ 生;
 *dǝ? *pə *tits *pə *khâi? *gaŋ (*gaŋ?) *sreŋ
 Should the times/seasons not arrive [properly], **one cannot force [Earth] to produce**;

事 不 究, 不 可 強 (彊) 成。
 *s-rǝ? *pə *kuh *pə *khâi? *gaŋ (*gaŋ?) *deŋ
 [should] affairs not be fulfilled, **one cannot force them to completion**.

自 若 以 處,
 *dzih *nak *lǝ? *k-hla?
 Earth is self-same and **gives room** [to everything],

以 度 天 下,
 *lǝ? *dâkh *thîn *gra?
 so that it is the measure of **all-under-Heaven**;

待 其 來 者 而 正 之,
 *dǝ? *gə *rǝ(k) *ta? *nə *teŋh *tǝ
 it awaits what comes and **corrects it**,

因 時 之 所 宜 而 定 之。
 *ʔin *dǝ? *tǝ *sra? *ŋai *nə *dêŋh *tǝ
 it follows whatever is appropriate for the season and **establishes it**,

同 男 女 之 功,
 *dôŋ *nôm *nra? *tǝ *kôŋ
 just like the **accomplishments** [= progeny] of men and women.

除 民 之 害,
 *dra *min *tǝ *gâts
 Eradicate harm to the people,

以 避 天 殃。
 *lǝ? *bekh *thîn *ʔaŋ
 in order to avoid Heaven's **devastation**.

田 野 開 辟,
 *lîn *la? *khâi *bek
 When fields and lands are opened and managed,

府 倉 實，
 *poʔ *tshâŋ *m-lit
 and the storehouses and granaries are filled,

民 眾 殷。
 *min *tuŋh *ʔən
 the people multiply and flourish.

無 曠 其 眾，
 *ma *khwâŋh *gə *tuŋh
 If we do not encourage their multiplying

以 為 亂 梯。
 *ləʔ *wai *rôns *thî
 this is the ladder to chaos.

時 將 有 反，
 *də *tsaŋ *wəʔ *panʔ
 For [in that case] sooner or later there will be **rebellion**,

事 將 有 間，
 *s-rəʔ *tsaŋ *wəʔ *krêns
 and [royal] affairs will have **interruptions**;

必 有 以 知 天 地 之 恒 制，
 *pit *wəʔ *ləʔ *tre *thîn *draih *tə *gəŋ *tats / *kets
 there definitely will be that by which to know Heaven and Earth's **unchanging laws**,

乃 可 以 有 天 下 之 成 利。
 *nôʔ *khâiʔ *ləʔ *wəʔ *thîn *graʔ *tə *deŋ *rih / *C.ri[t]-s (B)
 this can be used to attain All-Under-Heaven's **complete benefits**.

事 無 間，
 *s-rəʔ *ma *krêns
 [When royal] affairs are not **interrupted**,

時 無 反，
 *də *ma *panʔ
 the times are without **rebellion**,

則 撫 民 保 教 以 須 之。』
 *tsâk *phaʔ *min *pûʔ *krâuh *ləʔ *sno *tə
 therefore you must support the people and maintain the doctrine by following this
 [principle].”

Section 2: Fan Li Recommends the Use of Soft Power

王 曰：
 *waŋ *wat
 The king said,

「不 穀 之 國 家，
 *pə *kók *tə *kwók *krá
 “Bugu’s royal family,

蠡 之 國 家 也，
 *ré? *tə *kwók *krá *lai?
 is [also] your royal family;

蠡 其 圖 之 ！」
 *ré? *gə *də *tə
 you, then, carry out your plan.”

對 曰：
 *tùts *wat
 [Fan] replied, saying:

「四⁶⁵ 封 之 內，
 *sis *poŋ *tə *núts
 “Inside the four interior regions

百 姓 之 事，
 *prák *səŋh *tə *s-rə?
 are the common people’s **affairs**:

時 節 三 樂，
 *də? *tsít *sôm *ráuk
 seasonally regulate the ‘Three Joys,’

不 亂 民 功，
 *pə *róns *min *kónŋ
 don’t disturb the people in their accomplishments [= procreation],

不 逆 天 時，
 *pə *ŋrak *thín *də?
 do not go against Heaven’s [ordering of the] **seasons**.

五 穀 睦⁶⁶ 熟，
 *ŋâ? *kók *mruk *duk
 Then the five grains will peaceably ripen,

民 乃 蕃 滋，
 *min *nô? *ban *tsə
 the people will reproduce and **multiply**,

君 臣 上 下
 *kun *gin *daŋ? *gra?
 and lords and servants, superiors and inferiors,

交 得 其 志，
 *kr(i)au *tâk *gə *təh
 will jointly get what they **desire**.

蠱 不 如 種 也。
 *réʔ *pə *na *toŋʔ *laiʔ
 I am not as good as Zhong.”

Section 3: *Fan Li Explains the Value of Constancy (Yin and Yang) in Foreign Affairs*

四 封 之 外,
 *sis *poŋ *tə *ŋwâts
 “**Outside** the four interior regions,

敵 國 之 制,
 *dêk *kwôk *tə *tats / *kets
in the management of enemy states

立 斷 之 事,
 *rəp *tônʔ *tə *s-rəʔ
 let the establishing and severing of affairs

因 陰 陽 之 恒,
 *ʔin *ʔəm *laŋ *tə *gəŋ
 reflect yin and yang’s **eternal continuity**

順 天 地 之 常,
 *m-luns *thîn *draih *tə *daŋ
 and follow Heaven and Earth’s **constancy**:

柔 而 不 屈,
 *nu *nə *pə *khut
 be yielding but not pliable,

強 而 不 剛,
 *gaŋ *nə *pə *kâŋ
 be strong but not **inflexible**;

德 虐 之 行,
 *tôk *ŋauk *tə *grâŋ
 virtuous and wicked **actions**

因 以 為 常;
 *ʔin *ləʔ *wai *daŋ
 conform to attain this **constancy**.

死 生 因 天 地 之 刑,
 *siʔ *sreŋ *ʔin *thîn *draih *tə *gêŋ
 Death and life conform to Heaven and Earth’s **shapes** [or **punishments**],

天 因 人,
 *thîn *ʔin *nin
 but Heaven acts in conformity with the **people**,

聖 人 因 天;
 *lhəŋh *nin *ʔin *thín
 the sage conforms to **Heaven**;

人 自 生 之,
 *nin *dzih *sreŋ *tə
 people themselves **give birth to it**,

天 地 形 之,
 *thín *draih *gəŋ *tə
 Heaven and Earth **shape it**,

聖 人 因 而 成 之。
 *lhəŋh *nin *ʔin *nə *deŋ *tə
 the sage conforms to and completes its reckoning.

是 故 戰 勝 而 不 報,
 *deʔ *káh *tans *lhəŋh *nə *pə *pùh
 For this reason battles can be won yet never reported,

取 地 而 不 反,
 *tshoʔ *draih *nə *pə *panʔ
 one can win territory and there no rebellion occurs.

兵 勝 于 外,
 *praŋ *lhəŋh *wa *ŋwáts
 The army is victorious **abroad**,

福 生 于 內,
 *pək *sreŋ *wa *núts
 prosperity is created **domestically**.

用 力 甚 少 而 名 聲 章 明,
 *loŋh *rək *dəmʔ *hjauʔ *nə *meŋ *hjeŋ *taŋ *mraŋ
 The effort expended is very small and **the reputation acquired is great and brilliant**;

種 亦 不 如 蠡 也。」
 *toŋʔ *jak *pə *na *réʔ *laiʔ
 as such, Zhong is also not equal to me.”

王 曰:
 *waŋ *wat
 The king said,

「諾。」
 *nak
 “Agreed,”

令 大 夫 種 為 之。
 *reŋh *dás *pa *toŋʔ *wai *tə
 and commanded Grandee Zhong to implement it [= Fan's plan].

Section 1: The first section of the speech by Fan Li evidences a wide range of phonorhetorical patterns and styles. The second and third lines seem to offer a rhyming couplet (first documented by Jiang Yougao), albeit in highly irregular 9-4 meter and by employing *-it vocalism (words in the traditional *zhi* 質 rhyme group) to emphasize the phrase final words “one” or “unity” (*yi* 一 *ʔit) and “fail” (*shi* 失 *lhit). If the *-t final tentatively proposed in the Baxter-Sagart system is correct, one could equally read this opening section as a four-line AAXA perfectly rhymed passage in 9-4-7-9 meter, ending with “benefit” (*li* 利 *rih, *C.ri[t]-s in the Baxter-Sagart reconstruction). The next part of the passage comprises three metrically identical perfectly-rhyming couplets in sequence, with four, seven, and four graphs per line and employing rhymes in *-eŋ, *-eŋ, and *-a, respectively. The first tetrasyllabic couplet features the phrase-final words “creation” or “to produce” (*sheng* 生 *sreŋ) and “completion” (*cheng* 成 *deŋ), while the final tetrasyllabic couplet ends in “give room to” (*chu* 處 *k-hlaʔ) and the “under” of “All-under-Heaven” (*tian xia* 天下 *thîn *graʔ). The central heptasyllabic couplet provides a nice example of syntactic parallelism and phrasal repetition, as both lines employ the formula “X不Y, 不可強 Z,” where Z represents the same phrase-final rhyme words as in the first couplet in the sequence, though in reverse order. Following these couplets, the next three lines have a metrically irregular AAa rhyme sequence of lines seven, eight, and five graphs long, respectively; the first two lines feature a double-rhyme based on the words “to correct” (*zheng* 正 *teŋh) and “to fix in place” or “to establish” (*ding* 定 *dêŋh), followed by the particle *zhi* 之, with the cross-rhyming graph “accomplishments” (*gong* 功 *kôŋ) coming at the end of the final pentasyllabic line.

After a break of seven lines that seem to employ no phonorhetorical devices at all, we encounter another group of three parallel-phrased *he yun* cross-rhyming couplets, with metric lengths of four, nine, and three, respectively, not dissimilar to sequences of rhymed couplets in Han period “parallel prose” (*pian wen* 駢文) style.⁶⁷ The cross-rhyming words at the end of these couplets also signify a subtle shift in tone, as Fan Li explicitly warns of “rebellion” (*fan* 反 *panʔ) and “interruption” (*jian* 間 *krêns), bookending the longer lines that seem to end in a double rhyme (depending on whether *zhi* 制 and *li* 利 would constitute a *he yun* cross-rhyme) and contain his plea for reliance upon “unchanging laws” (*hengzhi* 恒制 *gôŋ *tats/*kets) to attain “complete benefits” (*chengli* 成利 *deŋ *rih/*C.rit-s). After Fan’s unrhymed concluding statement urging the king to “support the people and maintain the doctrine,” a terse assent to Fan’s plan ends the section. (The king speaks in blank prose; there are no examples of rhyme in direct speech by the king in these texts.)

Section 2: The second short section provides the introduction to Fan Li’s next speech that emphasizes taking Heaven as a model and using “constancy,”

meaning that with patience all will work itself out in the proper time. The ten lines in this section form an XAXXA–XAXA–X rhyme pattern; with the exception of the nonrhyming last line (simply a direct aside to the king), all are in tetrasyllabic meter. Lines 2, 5, 7, and 9 end in words featuring *-ə finals, “affairs” (*shi* 事 *s-rəʔ), “seasons” (*shi* 時 *dəʔ), “multiply” (*zi* 滋 *tsə), and “desire” (*zi* 滋 *tsə), forming perfect rhymes. “Seasons,” “multiply,” and “desire” are all positive terms here; the effect of these words rhyming perfectly in regular meter imparts a general feeling of constancy to the passage on multiple levels.⁶⁸

Section 3: The final section of Fan Li’s speech opens with a rhyming tetrasyllabic couplet employing the phrase-final words “outside” (*wai* 外 *ŋwâts) and “to manage” (*zhi* 制 *tats/*kets). The passage comprising the next thirteen lines then features regular use of phrase-final perfect- or cross-rhyming words ending in *-ŋ or *-n, words from the traditional *yang* 陽 (*-aŋ), *geng* 耕 (*-êŋ), and *zheng* 蒸 (*-êŋ) rhyme groups in particular. Ten of the thirteen lines appear to employ some form of rhyme; following the grammar, one can tentatively propose an XaA (4–5–5) XAAA (4–4–4–4) aαα (7–3–4) aaX (4–4–7) rhyme scheme for the passage. Words like “eternal continuity” (*heng* 恒 *gêŋ), “constancy” (*chang* 常 *daŋ), “behavior” (*xing* 行 *grâŋ), “form” or “to shape” (*xing* 刑 *gêŋ, read as its homophone *xing* 形 *gêŋ; it could also just mean “punishments”), “to give birth to” or “life” (*sheng* 生 *sreŋ), and the rhymed pair of “people” (*ren* 人 *nin) and “Heaven” (*tian* 天 *thîn) are among the phrase-final terms that rhyme or cross-rhyme in this section, all with powerful positive connotations. In the last seven lines, one final syntactically parallel tetrasyllabic couplet employs the words “abroad” or “outside” (*wai* 外 *ŋwâts) and “domestic” or “inside” (*nei* 內 *nûts) in an intriguing cross-rhyme featuring antonyms in phrase-final position.⁶⁹ Regular use of syntactic parallelism within tetrasyllabic meter predominates, though there are enough non-tetrasyllabic lines that there is no perfectly continuous rhythm to this passage (unlike the second section above). It is also worth noting that five of the final seven lines do not seem to rhyme or cross-rhyme in any way, so Fan departs from his cadenced rhymed speech as he makes the final conclusion to his argument, though he does continue to use syntactic parallelism; this style echoes that of the other chapters of the *Discourses*: widespread syntactic parallelism but little or no use of rhyme.

In this dialogue Fan Li makes an eloquent case for patience as the king weighs military invasion of Wu, arguing that, like the seasons and the “unchanging laws of Heaven and Earth,” everything works out best when events happen at the appropriate time, and so this is the case with military invasion as well. He employs a range of phonorhetorical devices in the more heavily patterned sections, including repetition of parallel phrases and use of a wider variety of rhyme groups than seen in the *Zuo Commentary* and narrative texts from earlier eras, including words from the *zhi* 質 rhyme group like “one” or “unity”

(*yi* 一 *ʔit) and “loss” (*shi* 失 *lhit), words from the *yu* 魚 rhyme group like “give room to” (*chu* 處 *k-hlaʔ) and the “under” of “All-under-Heaven” (*tian xia* 天下 *thîn *graʔ), and words from the *zhi* 之 rhyme group like “affairs” (*shi* 事 *s-rəʔ), “seasons” (*shi* 時 *də), “multiply” (*zi* 滋 *tsə), and “desire” (*zi* 滋 *tsə), along with the sections employing words from the *zheng* 蒸, *yang* 陽, and *geng* 耕 rhyme groups, like “eternal continuity” (*heng* 恒 *gân), “constancy” (*chang* 常 *daŋ), “behavior” (*xing* 行 *grân), “punishments” or “to form”/ “shape” (*xing* 刑 *gên and *xing* 形 *gên), and “to give birth to” or “life” (*sheng* 生 *sren). Fan employs both perfect rhyme and cross-rhyme and twice uses a phrase-final double-rhyme (rhyme word + *zhi* 之) construction similar to that used in poems like “Magpie’s Nest” 鵲巢 (Quechao), “Valley Wind” 谷風 (Gufeng), and “The Red Bow” 彤弓 (Tonggong) from the *Classic of Poetry*. Just as in those poems, much of his speech is in tetrasyllabic meter, though the rhymes tend not to fall as regularly as they do in the poems anthologized in the *Poetry*; to this reader his speeches read more like cadenced prose, with rhyming or cross-rhyming of phrase-final words employed primarily to provide emphasis for key concepts. Fan will employ similar tactics in his other speeches preserved in the *Discourses*; his ninth speech provides an excellent comparative example.

Ninth Dialogue between Fan Li and the King of Yue in the Latter “Discourses of Yue” Chapter

The ninth dialogue in the chapter takes place just after the king of Yue has decided to attack the state of Wu; at this point, Fan Li counsels patience and simply holding their position rather than rashly attacking and exposing themselves. He uses the natural patterns of Heaven and Earth and of yin and yang to support his argument, stating that, as the seasons come and go and the moon waxes and wanes, so also should one behave, biding one’s time until ready and then striking at the opportune moment.

The sections below make up one long speech by Fan Li; as in the previous example, he consistently employs rhyme among his phrase-final words, often combining the rhymed portions with metrical consistency (mainly couplets in which the lines are either tetrasyllabic or occasionally pentasyllabic). As in the previous section, Fan employs patterns where each vocalism is featured within a discrete passage; four different types of vocalism are evidenced here. Most striking, unlike the previous examples, this speech has no detectable obvious uses of *he yun* cross-rhyme; exactly 50 percent of the lines in the speech (25 of 50) end in a word that either rhymes with the final graph in the previous line or forms part of a phonetic pattern that runs across several lines and matches the normal shifts in the grammar and content of the text, so the feeling is once again of a heavily cadenced argument in metrically regular syntactically parallel rhyming prose.

Ninth Dialogue between Fan Li and the King of Yue in the Latter “Discourses of Yue” Chapter: Phonetics and Translation

Section 1: Fan Li Explains the Military Strategy of Constancy

范 蠡 曰：
*bam? *ré? *wat
Fan Li said:

「臣 聞 古 之 善 用 兵 者，
*gin *mən *kâ? *tə *dan? *loŋh *praŋ *ta?
Your servant has heard: those ancients who were good at using the **military**

贏 縮 以 為 常，
*leŋ *sruk *lə? *wai *daŋ
took plenty and scarcity to be **constants**,

四 時 以 為 紀，
*sis *də *lə? *wai *kə?
took the four seasons to be [their] **guideline**,

無 過⁷⁰ 天 極，
*ma *koih *thîn *gək
and did not exceed Heaven's boundaries [= limitations].

究 數 而 止。
*kuh *sroh *nə *tə?
They got to the inherent limit [of things] and **stopped**.

天 道 皇 皇，
*thîn *lû? *wâŋ *wâŋ
The way of Heaven is verily **august**,

日 月 以 為 常，
*nit *ŋwat *lə? *wai *daŋ
Presenting the sun and moon as its measures of **constancy**:

明 者 以 為 法，
*mraŋ *ta? *lə? *wai *pap
It offers celestial bodies to be taken as models,

微 者 則 是 行。
*məi *ta? *tsək *de? *grâŋ
and the subtle [=lesser] things thereby are **moved**.

陽 至 而 陰，
*laŋ *tits *nə *ʔəm
Yang/Light ends with the dark/yin,

陰 至 而 陽，
*ʔəm *tits *nə *laŋ
where yin ends, there is **yang**;

日 困 而 還，
 *nit *khûns *nə *s-wen
 when the sun is enveloped [by night] it then returns,

月 盈 而 匡⁷¹。
 *ŋwat *leŋ *nə *khwaŋ
 the moon waxes and **wanes**."

Section 2: The Ancients Used Yin and Yang Tactics in Military Engagement

古 之 善 用 兵 者，
 *kâ? *tə *dan? *loŋh *praŋ *ta?
 "The ancients who were good at using **the military**

因 天 地 之 常，
 *ʔin *thîn *draih *tə *daŋ
 relied upon Heaven and Earth's **constancy**,

與 之 俱 行。
 *la? *tə *ko *grāŋ
 following them in their **actions**.

後 則 用 陰，
 *hóh *tsək *loŋh *ʔəm
 When at a disadvantage, they used yin [= stealth];

先 則 用 陽；
 *sôn *tsək *loŋh *laŋ
 when at an advantage, they used **yang** [= brute force].

近 則 用 柔，
 *gən? *tsək *loŋh *nu
 At close hand, they used suppleness,

遠 則 用 剛。
 *wan? *tsək *loŋh *kâŋ
 from afar, they used **hardness**."

Section 3: As with Light (Yang) and Darkness (Yin), Be Patient until the Time Is Right

後 無 陰 蔽，
 *hóh *ma *ʔəm *pets
 "If those in the rear lack darkness's **cover**

先 無 陽 察，
 *sôn *ma *laŋ *tshrét
 and those in the front do not have the light to **investigate** [= gather intelligence],

用 人 無 藝，
 *loŋh *nin *ma *ŋets
 [this is] using people without **skill**.

往 從 其 所，
 *waj? *dzon? *gə *sra?

Each runs off and goes to his own **place**:

剛 強 以 御，
 *kəŋ *gaŋ *lə? *ŋah

When [using] hardness and strength to **direct** [things],

陽 節 不 盡，
 *laŋ *tsit *pə *dzin?

in the light [= warm] seasons [of farm tasks], do not exhaust [the people],

不 死 其 野。
 *pə *si? *gə *la?

[so that one's army] will not die in the **field**.

彼 來 從 我，
 *pai? *rək *dzon? *ŋai?

If they [the enemy] come and pursue us,

固 守 勿 與。
 *ká(k)h *hju? *mət *la?

be solid and hold your position, do not **engage with them** [= counterattack].

若 將 與 之，
 *nak *tsaŋ *la? *tə

If you do engage with them,

必 因 天 地 之 災，
 *pit *ʔin *thín *draih *tə *tsô

one necessarily must rely on Heaven-and-Earth's calamities."

Section 4: Fan Li Recommends Using Yin or Yang Tactics as Appropriate for the Situation

又 觀 其 民 之 饑 飽 勞 逸 以 參 之。
 *wəh *kwan *gə *min *tə *kəi *prú? *rau *lit *lə? *tshəm *tə

"Further, regard the famine and satiation [= well-being] of the people, their [times of] work and relaxation, so as to match with them.

盡 其 陽 節、盈 吾 陰 節 而 奪 之，
 *dzin? *gə *laŋ *tsit *leŋ *ŋə *ʔəm *tsit *nə *lót *tə

Exhaust them in the light [= farming] season, fill up our dark [= leisure] season, and so devastate them.

宜 為 人 客，
 *ŋai *wai *nin *khrək

When it is appropriate to act as guest,

剛 強 而 力 疾；
 *kəŋ *gaŋ *nə *rək *dzit

Be resolute and use force swiftly;

陽 節 不 盡，
 *laŋ *tsit *pə *dzin?
 [so that] the *yang* power is not exhausted.

輕 而 不 可 取。
 *kheŋ *nə *pə *khài? *tsho?
 Even when insubstantial, it cannot be [easily] taken.

宜 為 人 主，
 *ŋai *wai *nin *to?
 When it is appropriate to act as lord,

安 徐 而 重 固；
 *ʔân *s-la *nə *droŋ? *kâ(k)h
 [act] with harmony and dignity, weighty and immovable,

陰 節 不 盡，
 *ʔəm *tsit *pə *dzin?
 thus the *yin* power is not exhausted,

柔 而 不 可 迫。
 *nu *nə *pə *khài? *prāk
 and even when weak one cannot be compelled.”

Section 4: Fan Li Gives Military Advice

凡 陳⁷² 之 道，
 *bam *drins *tə *lû?
 “As far as **the way of** arraying forces,

設 右 以 為 牝⁷³，
 *nhet *wə? *lə? *wai *bin?
 [if you] set up your right flank as the female [= defense],

益 左 以 為 牡，
 *ʔek *tsâi? *lə? *wai *mû?
 build up the left as the **male** [= offense],

蚤 晏 無 失，
 *tsû? *ʔêns *ma *lhít
 then early and late do not expose yourself to loss.

必 順 天 道，
 *pit *m-luns *thín *lû?
 One must obey Heaven's **ways**:

周 旋 無 究。
 *tiu *s-wen *ma *kuh
 Surround and revolve but never **concentrate** [your forces].

今 其 來 也，
 *kəm *gə *rôk *lai?
 And when they come [to battle],

剛 強 而 力 疾，
 *kâŋ *gaŋ *nə *rək *dzit
 be hard and strong and exert power swiftly.

王 姑 待 之。」
 *waŋ *kâ *dôʔ *tə
 The king for the moment [should] await [the proper time].”

王 曰：
 *waŋ *wat
 The king said:

「諾。」
 *nak
 “Agreed,”

弗 與 戰。
 *pət *laʔ *tans
 and did not join battle [with the enemy].

Section 1: The opening line of the first two sections exhibits an unusual phonorhetorical device in which the ostensible rhyme word, “weapons” or “military” (*bing* 兵 *praŋ, originally adduced by Jiang Yougao), is not the final word in the phrase but is followed by the particle *zhe* 者 *taʔ. Since *bing* in these lines does rhyme perfectly with the following lines, it seems to make good sense to include it in the phonorhetorical structure, though it is difficult to determine exactly how the particle would have been read here. Metric irregularity is also a primary feature in this section, as the rhyme scheme seems to have been AABXB AAXA XAXA, but the lines are of 8, 5, 5, 4, 4; 4, 5, 5, 5; 4, 4, 4, and 4 graphs long, respectively; only the final tetrasyllabic four-line section displays both perfect rhyme between phrase-final graphs and perfect metric regularity. The rhyme words in this section are similar though not identical to those in Fan Li’s speech detailed in the previous example. Following “military” and “constants” (*chang* 常 *daŋ), the B rhymes are words featuring *-ə vocalism (from the traditional *zhi* 之 rhyme group): “guideline” (*ji* 紀 *kəʔ) and “to stop” (*zhi* 止 *təʔ). The final five rhyme words, all featuring *-aŋ vocalism (in the traditional *yang* 陽 rhyme group), include weighty terms like “august” (*huang* 皇 *wâŋ), “constant” again, “to move” (*xing* 行 *grâŋ), *yang* power (*yang* 陽 *laŋ), and “to wane” (*kuang* 匡 *khwaŋ).

Section 2: The second section of this speech continues the regular use of *yang* 陽 rhyme group words in phrase-final position, repeating the terms used in the first section and adding only “hardness” (*gang* 剛 *kâŋ). After the opening three lines of six, five, and four graphs each, the final four lines are all tetrasyllabic and perfectly rhymed, just as in the opening section.

Section 3: The third section of the speech, while completely tetrasyllabic except for the very last line, departs from the patterns of *-aŋ vocalism and instead features a series of three lines ending in words in phrase-final position with *-et finals (the traditional *yue* 月 rhyme group), followed by four lines in six with *-a finals (the traditional *yu* 魚 rhyme group) in an AAXAXA construction, and a final unrhymed pair. The rhyming words in this section are also notable as they diverge somewhat from the expected weighty terms describing good government and the movements of the cosmos; instead, Fan Li employs such words as “cover” (*bi* 蔽 *pets), “investigate” (*cha* 察 *tshrât or *ts^hret), and “skill” (*yi* 藝 *jets), followed by “place” (*suo* 所 *sraʔ), “to direct” (*yu* 御 *ŋah), “the wilds/fields” (*ye* 野 *laʔ), and “to engage with” (*yu* 與 *laʔ), simply emphasizing a new set of key terms while maintaining the same form.

Section 4: The fourth section seems to employ no phonaesthetic devices whatsoever, as Fan Li uses the metaphor of host and guest to describe proper conduct. As noted above, use of an unrhymed section to separate phonorhetorically patterned passages is not atypical of this style of composition.

Section 5: In the final section of the speech, Fan Li once again uses words from a relatively rare style, employing *-u vocalism (words from the traditional *you* 幽 rhyme group) to accentuate metrically regular phonorhetorically patterned phrases. The six opening lines of the section follow an AXAXAA pattern, wherein the second and third lines are pentasyllabic but the rest are tetrasyllabic, with the rhyme word consistently in phrase-final position. The pentasyllabic lines are also syntactically parallel with antonyms in the final position, not unlike the use of *wai* 外 and *nei* 內 in his first speech above. The words Fan Li emphasizes in this final rhymed section are “way” (*dao* 道 *lûʔ) twice, “male” (*mu* 牡 *mûʔ), and “to concentrate” (*jiu* 究 *kuh); while perhaps less weighty than some of the terms listed above, these underscore his message that there are proper procedures for military engagement and that one can minimize losses and maximize gains by following the proper methods or “way.” And as in other sections, the final comment is in unadorned prose, here including a direct question to the sovereign, who replies with his assent.

In his ninth speech from the latter “Discourses of Yue” chapter, Fan Li successfully convinces the king not to rush into battle and imbues his military strategies with the rhetoric of constancy and balance. Most striking, he wraps his practical advice within largely tetrasyllabic rhyming prose, continuing his use of *-aŋ vocalism (traditional *yang* 陽 rhyme group words) in phrase-final position (as seen in the first speech), such as “constant” (*chang* 常 *dan), “august” (*huang* 皇 *wân), “to move” (*xing* 行 *grân), *yang* power (*yang* 陽 *laŋ), and “to wane” (*kuang* 匡 *khwaŋ), but also employing several other relatively rare forms of vocalism and rhyming as he makes his case (*-et, *-a, and *-u in particular),

Third Dialogue between Fan Li 范蠡 and the King of Yue in the Latter "Discourses of Yue" (《國語·越語下》 Chapter	
三年， *sɿm *nɿs Three years passed,	
而吳人遣之， *na *ŋwə *nɿn *khen? *tə and the people of Wu sent him [=Fan Li] back.	
歸及至于國， *kwai *gəp *tɿts *wa *kwək He returned home and then went to the capital.	
王問于范蠡曰： *waj *mɿs *wa *ham? *rə? *wat The king asked Fan Li about it [=his mission to Wu], saying:	
「簡事奈何？」 *tsit *s-tə? *nɿs *gɿi "How did the 'managing of affairs' go?"	
對曰： *tɿts *wat [Fan] replied, saying:	
「簡事者何也？」 *tsit *s-tə? *tə? *tə? *təh "With the 'managing of affairs,' it all depends on the Earth.	
天地萬物以爲一， *tsi *dɿwə *nɿn *pɿk *mɿs *mat *tə? *wəi *təi So it is that the Earth encompasses the ten thousand things and takes them as one,	
其事不失， *gəp *s-tə? *pə *tɿit and it carries out its missions without fail.	
生萬物，容畜禽獸， *sɿn *mɿs *mat *loŋ *rɿk *gɿm *təh [The Earth] gives birth to the ten thousand things, contains and nurtures the birds and beasts,	
德施於民而無其利， *təi *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? it thereby receives its reputation and is impartial in its benefits.	
美惡皆成， *mɿt *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? Both good and evil [fortune] are brought to completion,	
以養其生， *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? thereby nourishing its creation.	
時不至，不可強(彌)生； *tə? *pə *tɿts *pə *khi? *gəp (*gəp?) *sɿn Should the times/seasons not arrive [properly], one cannot force [Earth] to produce;	
事不成，不可強(彌)成。 *s-tə? *pə *kɿh *pə *khi? *gəp (*gəp?) *tə? [should] affairs not be fulfilled, one cannot force them to completion.	
自若以處， *təh *tə? *tə? *k-khə? Earth is self-same and gives room [to everything].	
以度天下， *tə? *təh *tɿn *grə? so that it is the measure of all-under-Heaven;	
待其來者而正之， *tə? *pə *təh *tə? *tə? *tə? it awaits what comes and corrects it.	
隨時之所宜而更之， *tɿn *tə? *tə? *sɿt *pə *tə? *tə? it follows whatever is appropriate for the season and establishes it.	
則男女之功， *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? just like the accomplishments [=progeny] of men and women.	
除民之害， *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? Eradicate harm to the people,	
以避天殃， *tə? *təh *tɿn *tə? in order to avoid Heaven's devastation.	
田野開闢， *tɿn *tə? *kɿh *tə? When fields and lands are opened and managed,	
府倉實， *pə? *təh *tə? and the storehouses and granaries are filled,	
民眾倍， *tɿn *tə? *tə? *tə? the people multiply and flourish.	
無勸其眾， *tə? *təh *tə? *tə? If we do not encourage their multiplying	
以爲亂梯， *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? this is the ladder to chaos.	

Key	
-ŋ 合韻 cross-rhyme	
-ŋ 押韻 perfect rhyme	
-n 合韻 cross rhyme	
-n 押韻 perfect rhyme	
-k 合韻 cross-rhyme	
-j 合韻 cross-rhyme	
-ai 押韻 perfect rhyme	
-ai 押韻 perfect rhyme	
-a 押韻 perfect rhyme	
-a 押韻 perfect rhyme	
-t 押韻 perfect rhyme	
-t 合韻 cross-rhyme	
-u 押韻 perfect rhyme	

Ninth Dialogue between Fan Li 范蠡 and the King of Yue in the Latter "Discourses of Yue" (《國語·越語下》 Chapter	
范蠡曰： *ham? *rə? *wat Fan Li said:	
「臣聞古之善用兵者， *tɿn *mɿn *kə? *tə? *dan? *loŋh *pɿn *tə? "Your servant has heard: those ancients who were good at using the military	
藏而以爲常， *tɿn *sɿk *tə? *wəi *dɿn took plenty and scarcity to be constants,	
隨時以爲紀， *tɿs *tə? *tə? *wəi *kə? took the four seasons to be [their] guideline,	
無過天極， *tə? *kɿh *tɿn *pə? and did not exceed Heaven's boundaries [=limitations].	
孰能而止， *kɿh *sɿk *tə? *tə? They got to the inherent limit [of things] and stopped.	
天道悠長， *tɿn *tə? *tə? *tə? The way of Heaven is verily august,	
日月以爲常， *tɿn *tə? *tə? *wəi *dɿn Presenting the sun and moon as its measures of constancy:	
明者以爲法， *mɿn *tə? *tə? *wəi *pə? It offers celestial bodies to be taken as models,	
微者則息行， *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? and the subtle [=lesser] things thereby are moved.	
陽至而陰， *tə? *tɿn *tə? *tə? Yang/light ends with the dark/yin,	
陰至而陽， *tə? *tɿn *tə? *tə? where yin ends, there is yang;	
日困而還， *tɿn *kɿh *tə? *tə? when the sun is enveloped [by night] it then returns,	
月盈而闕， *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? the moon waxes and wanes."	
古之善用兵者， *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? "The ancients who were good at using the military	
則天地之譽， *tɿn *tɿn *tə? *tə? relied upon Heaven and Earth's constancy,	
則之俱行， *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? following them in their actions.	
後則用陰， *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? When at a disadvantage, they used yin [=stealth];	
先則用陽， *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? when at an advantage, they used yang [=brute force].	
近則用柔， *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? At close hand, they used suppleness,	
遠則用剛， *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? from afar, they used hardness."	
夫陰隱蔽， *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? "If those in the rear lack darkness's cover	
則無所視， *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? and those in the front do not have the light to investigate [=gather intelligence].	
用人無藝， *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? [this is] using people without skill.	
往從其所， *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? Each runs off and goes to his own place:	
剛強以禦， *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? When [using] hardness and strength to direct [things],	
陽而不盡， *tə? *tə? *tə? *tə? in the light [=warm] seasons [of farm tasks], do not exhaust [the people],	

Figure 2. Visualization of phonetic devices in the *Discourses of the States*

Figure 2. *continued*

<p>時將有反。 *tə *waʔ *waʔ *panʔ For [in that case] sooner or later there will be rebellion.</p> <p>事將有間。 *s-aʔ *təŋ *waʔ *krɛm and [royal] affairs will have interruptions.</p> <p>必有以知天地之恒制。 *pit *waʔ *tə *tɛ *tʰin *drah *tə *gəp *tats / *kɛts there definitely will be that by which to know Heaven and Earth's unchanging laws.</p> <p>乃可以有天下之成利。 *nəʔ *kʰaiʔ *təʔ *waʔ *tʰin *graʔ *tə *deŋ *rih / *C.rɪ(t)-s (B) this can be used to attain All-Under-Heaven's complete benefits.</p> <p>事無間。 *s-aʔ *ma *krɛns [When royal] affairs are not interrupted.</p> <p>時無反。 *də *ma *panʔ the times are without rebellion.</p> <p>則撫民釋教以順之。 *rak *pʰaʔ *mɪn *pəʔ *kɪkʰəp *təʔ *səo *tə therefore you must support the people and maintain the doctrine by following this [principle]"</p> <p>王曰： *waŋ *wat The king said,</p> <p>「不穀之國家。 *pə *kək *tə *kwək *krá "Bugu's royal family,</p> <p>歲之國家也。 *nəʔ *tə *kwək *krá *təʔ is [also] your royal family;</p> <p>歲其國之！ *nəʔ *gə *dā *tə you, then, carry out your plan."</p> <p>對曰： *tʰu *wat [Fan] replied, saying:</p> <p>「四封之內。 *sɪs *pəŋ *tə *nəts "Inside the four interior regions</p> <p>百姓之事。 *pɪk *səŋ *tə *s-aʔ are the common people's affairs.</p> <p>時節三樂。 *dəʔ *tɛt *səm *rɪnk seasonally regulate the "Three Joys,"</p> <p>不亂民功。 *pə *rəns *mɪn *kəŋ don't disturb the people in their accomplishments [-procreation],</p> <p>不逆天時。 *pə *rɛnk *tʰin *dəʔ do not go against Heaven's [ordering of the] seasons.</p> <p>五穀睦熟。 *gəʔ *kək *mɪk *duk Then the five grains will peaceably ripen,</p> <p>民乃蕃滋。 *mɪn *nəʔ *tən *tsə the people will reproduce and multiply,</p> <p>君臣上下 *kɪm *gɪn *dɛŋʔ *grəʔ and lords and servants, superiors and inferiors,</p> <p>交得其志。 *kɪ(t)tsə *rak *gə *rəh will jointly get what they desire.</p> <p>歲不如種也。 *rɛʔ *pə *tə *təŋʔ *təʔ I am not as good as Zhong."</p> <p>四封之外。 *sɪs *pəŋ *tə *gwəts "Outside the four interior regions,</p> <p>敵國之制。 *dək *kwək *tə *tats / *kɛts in the management of enemy states</p> <p>立斷之事。 *rəp *tɛnʔ *tə *s-aʔ let the establishing and severing of affairs</p> <p>以陰陽之恒。 *tʰu *zəm *təŋ *tə *gə reflect yin and yang's eternal continuity</p> <p>順天地之常。 *m-həns *tʰin *drah *tə *dəŋ and follow Heaven and Earth's constancy;</p>	<p>不死其野。 *pə *sɪʔ *gə *təʔ [so that one's army] will not die in the field.</p> <p>彼來從我。 *pəʔ *rək *dəŋ *gəʔ If they [the enemy] come and pursue us,</p> <p>固守勿與。 *kɪkʰəp *həʔ *mɪt *təʔ be solid and hold your position, do not engage with them [-counterattack].</p> <p>若將與之。 *rak *tsəŋ *təʔ *tə If you do engage with them,</p> <p>必因天地之災。 *pit *zɪn *tʰin *drah *tə *tsɪ one necessarily must rely on Heaven-and-Earth's calamities."</p> <p>又觀其民之饑飽勞逸以命之。 *wəh *kwan *gə *mɪn *tə *kəʔ *pəʔ *rɪn *tɪt *təʔ *təhəm *tə "Further, regard the famine and satiation [-work-being] of the people, their [lines of] work and education, so as to march with them.</p> <p>盡其陽節。 嚴君陰節而費之。 *dɛnʔ *gə *təŋ *rɛk *təŋ *zəm *təʔ *nə *təʔ *tə Exhaust them in the light [-farming] season, fill up our dark [-leisure] season, and so devastate them.</p> <p>宜為人客。 *pəʔ *wəʔ *nɪn *khrək When it is appropriate to be as guest,</p> <p>剛強而力疾。 *kəŋ *gəŋ *nə *rək *dɪt be resolute and use force swiftly;</p> <p>陽節不盡。 *təŋ *tɪt *pə *dɛnʔ [so that] the yang power is not exhausted.</p> <p>輕而不可取。 *kheŋ *nə *pə *kʰaiʔ *təʔ Even when insubstantial, it cannot be [easily] taken.</p> <p>宜為人主。 *pəʔ *wəʔ *nɪn *təʔ When it is appropriate to act as lord,</p> <p>安徐而重固。 *ʔən *tə-lə *nə *dəŋʔ *kəʔkʰəp [act] with harmony and dignity, weighty and immovable,</p> <p>陰節不盡。 *zəm *tɪt *pə *dɛnʔ thus the yin power is not exhausted,</p> <p>柔而不可迫。 *mɪ *nə *pə *kʰaiʔ *pɪk and even when weak one cannot be compelled."</p> <p>左傳之順。 *tsəns *dɛnəm *tə *təʔ "As far as the way of arraying forces,</p> <p>設右以爲左。 *tɛʔət *wəʔ *tɛʔ *wəʔ *bɪnʔ [if you] set up your right flank as the female [-defense],</p> <p>築左以爲右。 *rɪk *tɛʔət *təʔ *wəʔ *wəʔ build up the left as the male [-offense],</p> <p>蚤晏無失。 *təʔ *rəns *mə *tɪt then early and late do not expose yourself to loss.</p> <p>必順不違。 *pɪt *tə-təns *tʰin *təʔ One must obey Heaven's ways:</p> <p>周旋相攻。 *tsəns *tə-wən *təns *kəh Surround and revolve but never concentrate [your forces].</p> <p>令其來也。 *kɪm *gə *rək *təʔ And when they come [to battle],</p> <p>剛強而力疾。 *kəŋ *gəŋ *nə *rək *dɪt be hard and strong and exert power swiftly.</p> <p>王姑待之。 *wəŋ *kə *dəʔ *tə The king for the moment [should] await [the proper time]"</p> <p>王曰： *waŋ *wat The king said:</p> <p>「諾。 *rak "Agreed."</p> <p>弗別戰。 *pət *təʔ *təns and did not join battle [with the enemy].</p>
---	--

Figure 2. *continued*

<p>柔而不剛， *nu *na *pə *khu be yielding but not pliable,</p> <p>強而不剛， *gəu *nə *pə *kūg be strong but not inflexible,</p> <p>德義之行， *tək *tək *tə *gəg virtuous and wicked actions</p> <p>順以爲常， *ʃin *təʃ *wəi *dɛg conform to attain this constancy.</p> <p>死生因天地之刑， *siʔ *sɛg *ʃin *tʃin *dralh *tə *gəg Death and life conform to Heaven and Earth's shapes [or punishments].</p> <p>夫因人， *fai *ʃin *nin but Heaven acts in conformity with the people,</p> <p>聖人因天， *tʃeŋh *nin *ʃin *tʃin the sage conforms to Heaven;</p> <p>人自生之， *nin *dɛh *sɛg *tə people themselves give birth to it.</p> <p>天地形之， *tʃin *dɛh *tʃin *tə Heaven and Earth shape it,</p> <p>聖人因而成之， *tʃeŋh *nin *ʃin *nə *dɛg *tə the sage conforms to and completes its reckoning.</p> <p>是故戰勝而不報， *deʔ *kūh *təus *tʃaŋh *nə *pə *pūh For this reason battles can be won yet never reported,</p> <p>取地而不反， *tʃoʔ *dralh *nə *pə *pənʔ one can win territory and there no rebellion occurs.</p> <p>兵勝于外， *pəŋh *tʃaŋh *wə *gəwəts The army is victorious abroad,</p> <p>福生于內， *fuk *tʃeŋh *wə *mɛts prosperity is created domestically.</p> <p>用力甚少而名聲章明， *tʃəŋh *tək *dɛmʔ *tʃəuʔ *tə *mɛg *tʃeŋh *təg *mɛŋ The effort expended is very small and the reputation acquired is great and brilliant,</p> <p>桓亦不如燕也， *həuʔ *tək *pə *nə *tʃeʔ *tʃiʔ as such, Zhong is also not equal to me.”</p> <p>王曰： *wəŋ *wət The king said,</p> <p>「諾」 *nək “Agreed,”</p> <p>今天夫桓爲之， *təŋh *dɛs *pə *tʃeŋh *wəi *tə and commanded Gunde Zhong to implement it [=Fan's plan].</p>
--

featuring phrase-final terms like “cover” (*bi* 蔽 *pets), “investigate” (*cha* 察 *tʃrât or *tsʰret), and “skill” (*yi* 藝 *jets), followed by “place” (*suo* 所 *sraʔ), “to direct” (*yu* 御 *ŋah), “the wilds/fields” (*ye* 野 *laʔ), and “to engage with” (*yu* 與 *laʔ), and then in the final section, “[the] way” (*dao* 道 *lûʔ) twice, “male” (*mu* 牡 *mûʔ), and “to concentrate” (*jiu* 究 *kuh). The speech seems to indicate that this style of phrase-final rhymes in regular meter was most important to Fan Li; depending on the terms he wished to emphasize, he would then construct the lines around them (much as one might do when writing a poem on a specific preselected theme). As he was ultimately successful, it is possible that this style is highlighted throughout this chapter to exemplify a relatively rare but highly effective method (as there is no evidence of its use in the rest of the *Discourses*) when employed by an especially erudite and skilled orator.

These brief examples demonstrate the various ways that the speeches attributed to Fan Li employ phonorhetorical patterns featuring mainly regular rhyming and occasional *he yun* cross-rhyming of the final graph or graphs (homoeoteleuton) in phonorhetorically patterned passages. Metric regularity is also common, with lines of four graphs predominating: in total, 46 percent of the lines in Fan Li’s speeches detailed above feature some type of phonetic device (51 of the 109 lines). As with the speeches in the *Zuo Commentary*, the color-coded visualization of the rhymes shown in fig. 2 illustrates the extraordinary amount of rhyme and cross-rhyme in these passages.

One main question, then, is why, in contrast with the widespread use of rhyme and cross-rhyme in the *Zuo Commentary*, should we find these patterns (with only a few small exceptions) only in *this* chapter in the *Discourses of the States*? The evidence seems to indicate that the composers of these texts (assuming that they were not heavily edited by a later transmitter) would have been aware of the use of both rhyme and cross-rhyme as a rhetorical device, and the other wise ministers featured in the *Discourses* simply preferred blank prose over the metrically regular rhyme prose attributed to Fan Li.⁷⁴ It is also not the case that the other speeches in the *Discourses* used a very different vocabulary than Fan Li; on the contrary, table 1 shows the total number of uses for some of the important terms he chose to use as rhyming words in phrase-final position, and whether they are found in phrase-final position in other speeches.

Table 1. Common rhyme words in the *Discourses of the States*

<i>Graph</i>	<i>Old Chinese</i>	<i>Gloss</i>	<i>Total use (use in phrase-final position)</i>
成	*deŋ	completion	209 (4)
生	*sreŋ	creation	151 (7)
正	*teŋh	to correct	59 (2)
定	*dêŋh	to establish	42 (3)
功	*kôŋ	accomplishments	60 (2)
恆	*gôŋ	eternal	9 (3)
常	*daŋ	constancy	42 (6)
剛	*kâŋ	hard(ness)	9 (5)
行	*grâŋ	actions/agents	209 (9)
反	*paŋ?	rebellion	60 (2)
間	*krên	interruptions	46 (2)
陽	*laŋ	yang/light	75 (7)
道	*lû?	(the) way	101 (5)

Ultimately we must assume that this was a stylistic choice on the part of the composer of the speeches in the latter “Discourses of Yue” chapter, perhaps evoking the phonorhetorical style of discourse found within the *Zuo Commentary* (which most scholars date to earlier periods) discussed at length above. However, given the rise of the consistent rhyming in the “parallel prose” style popular during the Former Han, and the various forms of rhyme prose evidenced in the excavated Warring States–era documents from the state of Chu, the phonorhetorical patterns in these speeches do not seem necessarily to indicate any specific time period or genre.⁷⁵ To this reader they most likely simply reflect a style of discourse desired by individual composers as a means to most effectively persuade their superiors by emphasizing key concepts with regular sound patterns. Thus, the use of rhyme to underscore key terms in phrase-final position within metrically regular patterns can simply be understood as a particularly artful tactic intended to affect the exalted listener and compel him to acquiesce to the minister’s counsels, especially in all of these examples, featuring direct remonstrances during periods of tension and drama, when the very fate of the state and its people was at risk.

Preliminary Conclusions and Future Research

While use of large-scale phonological databases and parsing algorithms like those provided in the *Guhanyu ciyuan zidian* 古漢語詞源字典 (*Digital Etymological Dictionary of Old Chinese*; hereafter *Digital EDOC*) potentially represents a new method by which one can efficiently assemble the phonetic reconstructions for entire early Chinese narrative texts and thus a means to make real progress in understanding the types of phonetic patterning, phonorhetorical devices, and literary artistry that underlie the words, it is important to temper our expectations, as it equally makes clear that there is still a great deal that we do not know about early Chinese phonology and sound systems and the precise roles sound played. We must consider that it is possible that the cross-rhymes in these passages may have rhymed perfectly in the dialects of their composers, and thus the conclusions of this study in fact simply represent new light thrust upon our lack of understanding of the vowel quality of these words during the Spring and Autumn and Warring States periods; equally possible is that, despite their ubiquity in these passages, these phonetic patterns were a subconscious rather than a conscious tactic on the part of the composers of these works. In all cases, the data provided by computational systems must be reviewed and evaluated in detail for two important reasons: (a) many graphs have multiple possible Old Chinese reconstructions, depending on usage; and (b) an overly mechanistic process can give initial indications of where rhymes and other phonetic patterns might lie, but these need to be closely interrogated on a case-by-case basis before the results can be considered reliable.

That said, let us consider the larger conclusions that one might be able to draw from the evidence presented above and a few suggestions for further research. Most important, the words in phrase-final position that comprise the primary phonorhetorical devices in these passages were clearly not chosen at random but were consistently designed to highlight the key terms within the speech. For the two examples from the *Zuo Commentary*, these rhyming terms include important and positive words like “kin[ship]” (*qin* 親 *tshin), one’s “innate nature” (*xing* 性 *senh), “life” (*sheng* 生 *sren), and “standards” (*jing* 經 *kêŋ), but also many with strongly negative connotations, like “stupid” (*yin* 瞢 *ŋrən or *ŋrin), “evil” (*jian* 姦 *krân), and “hatred” (*e* 惡 *ʔakh). In the *Discourses of the States*, we encounter repeated use of significant and positive terms like “completion” (*cheng* 成 *den), “life” or “creation” (*sheng* 生 *sren), “constancy” (*chang* 常 *den), “yang power” or “light” (*yang* 陽 *lan), and even “skill” (*yi* 藝 *ŋets) and “the way” (*dao* 道 *lûʔ), alongside negative words like “rebellion” (*fan* 反 *panʔ) and “interruption” (*jian* 間 *krêns).

The types of rhyming and the metrics of these passages also deserve close attention; while perfect rhyme predominates, often involving words with the nasal finals *-n or *-ŋ, each text also uses at least two other rhyme groups and seems to employ a wide array of cross-rhyming devices both to continue the emphasis on the phrase-final key terms and (especially in metrically regular passages) as a device to maintain the sound structure throughout the entire passage. There is slightly greater diversity of rhyme groups in the *Discourses* compared with those evidenced in the *Zuo Commentary*, including phrase-final rhyme words featuring final *-t, *-a, and *-u, the last of these a clever sequence riffing on the word “the way” (*dao* 道 *lûʔ). In terms of metrics, tetrasyllabic form is by far the most common (a total of 27 of the 46 rhyming and cross-rhyming lines in the passages from the *Zuo Commentary* consist of four graphs, as do 36 of the 57 lines in the *Discourses*), as there are often long alternately rhymed sequences of predominantly tetrasyllabic phrases. We also find a number of pentasyllabic lines and couplets, a single cross-rhyming trisyllabic couplet in the second example from the *Discourses*, and a few examples of highly irregular meter.

David Schaberg has recently argued that the phonetic patterns based on words with the final consonant *-ŋ in the Western Zhou bronze inscriptions and the chapters of the *Classic of Documents* exemplify a specific “royal style” and “language of command”:

The placement of words with these *finals* (not only these rhymes), at the ends of phrases (more than anywhere else) associated an utterance with the royal style and the style of command. It is one prosodic feature of the language of command, and possibly of all Western Zhou ceremonial language, that words with -ng finals, whatever their

main vowels, form patterns by being placed at the ends of consecutive or proximate phrases. . . . This is not rhyme, but consonance (i.e. alliteration of finals); the pattern is the repetition of common phrases and *-ng* finals. Words ending in *-n* were apparently drawn into this pattern as well: **C-rjing(s)* 令 is matched in near-rhyme with words of the *zhen* 真 rhyme group (OC *-*in*) in several bronze inscriptions. . . . All of the *Shu* chapters that are generally dated to the Western Zhou make multiple references to ming; most of these references are at phrase-ends and contribute to consonance patterns in *-ng*.⁷⁶

Given the evidence in these case studies, the phonorhetorical style of this “language of command” seems to have carried on into the narrative historiographical prose of the Spring and Autumn and Warring States periods, albeit with an ever-widening use of phonetic devices: a greater diversity of rhyme groups and a greater emphasis on true rhyming and long sequences of tetrasyllabic phrases.⁷⁷ As the famous dictum from Early China states, it is “the tones of a well-ordered age” that reflect harmony in government, so the use of regular acoustic and euphonic patterns in these speeches likely reflects a rhetorical strategy, primarily as a tactic to attempt to foster feelings of harmony between the speaker and the sovereign to add to the persuasiveness of the speaker’s argument, but secondarily, if instituted as policy, one might also expect that well-ordered and phonetically pleasing rhetoric could be used to promulgate the idea that one is living in a “well-ordered age” and to foster feelings of harmony among the common people.

By closely examining the Zhou to *Zuo* to *Discourses* progression we have perhaps gained a preliminary indication that a formalization of rhyme and phonorhetoric seems to have taken place in prose during the time period represented in the span of the composition (and/or transmission) of these works, leading into or perhaps simultaneous with the rise of “parallel prose” style. Continued research into these texts and others from these time periods (the works of the “hundred scholars” [*zhuzi baijia* 諸子百家] for example)⁷⁸ will shed further light upon the euphony, rhetorical structures, and true depths of literary artistry that ancient Chinese authors were producing and eventually lead to a more thorough understanding of how the use of sound was regarded and utilized in concert with semantic, syntactic, and metric patterns, all neatly arrayed for maximum beauty and maximum effect on the listeners and/or readers of these classic works.

Appendix: Digital Methods for Comparative Old Chinese Phonology and Philology

The arduous task of performing full phonological analyses of each graph in a given source has long been one of the greatest hurdles to the study of phonetic patterns and phonorhetoric in Chinese literature. This research has normally

been conducted by comparing data from rhyme dictionaries and commentaries, rhyme words in poetry, and the reconstructions and detailed linguistic studies that have comprised the life's work of many outstanding linguists and phonologists. As linguists tend to reconstruct individual "words" (and/or the histories of specific graphs and graphemes, in the Chinese case), their work has not tended to be used in larger textual analyses except in limited comparisons of specific words, often in parallel or "poetic" constructions. Even the outstanding work by the Qing phonologists along with more recent studies of phonetic patterns by linguists like Bernhard Karlgren have tended to be concerned primarily with documenting rhymes and rhyme words, to the exclusion of larger analyses of euphony and sequences of graphs with phonetic correspondences that do not figure into well-established rhyme patterns.

The large-scale lexical work that serves as the foundation for this study is made possible by digital texts and a suite of digital tools, a new method by which the hurdles to large-scale Chinese lexical spadework in the service of premodern phonological analysis can efficiently be overcome: the *Digital EDOC* currently hosted by the University of Chicago (edoc.uchicago.edu). While no resource approaching the scale or range of functions that the *Digital EDOC* provides has previously been developed, the concept of using digital lexicography and database systems to support large-scale phonological and philological analysis is not original to this endeavor.⁷⁹

Determining which system one should employ for the reconstruction of Old Chinese phonetics is by no means an easy task. A full review of all systems for reconstructing Old Chinese is well beyond the scope of this study, but it seems appropriate to include here a brief discussion of the rationale behind the choice to present primarily the reconstructions published by Axel Schuessler in his 2009 *Minimal Old Chinese and Later Han Chinese*, plus the *fanqie* pronunciations for these graphs in the *Zuo Commentary* as proposed by Lu Deming in the *Jingdian shiwen* 經典釋文 (Glosses on the Classics) and in the *Discourses of the States* as proposed by Song Xiang 宋庠 (996–1066) in his *Guoyu buyin* 國語補音 (Supplemental Phonetics for the *Discourses of the States*).

It is now the general consensus of most linguists working on early Chinese phonology that the most recent editions of the Baxter and Sagart reconstructions as reflected in their 2014 *Old Chinese: A New Reconstruction* form a radical break from the more traditional work of scholars like Wang Li, Li Fanggui 李方桂, Sergei Starostin, Pan Wuyun 潘悟云, Zhengzhang Shangfang 鄭張尚芳, Axel Schuessler, and other modern phonologists. As the phonetic patterns outlined in this study hold generally true no matter which system of reconstruction one uses, I decided to primarily employ the relatively conservative "Minimal Old Chinese" reconstructions developed by Axel Schuessler, on rare

occasion also including the reconstruction from 2015 edition of the 2014 Baxter-Sagart when significantly divergent from Schuessler's system (these are noted with the symbol "(B)" in the example texts above), with the caveat that future research may prove them to be more than "tentative and hypothetical conjecture" (to paraphrase Christoph Harbsmeier) and with the hope that new comparative methods will on further evaluation eventually be proved to be on the right track.⁸⁰ Pursuing algorithmically provided large-scale comparative analyses of the phonology of early Chinese texts should help us begin to determine where each of these reconstruction systems seems to be accurate, and where the evidence seems to point to different solutions.⁸¹ It is important to note that, when one speaks in linguistic terms of the "rimes" of Old Chinese (referring to the nucleus and the coda, forming the basis for the rhyme), most of the primary evidence used for the reconstructions is common to all the systems and employed in a consistent fashion across methodologies; using the Old Chinese reconstructions produced by any modern phonologist results in nearly identical phonetic patterns and euphonic devices based on rhyme (though there are at times significant differences in the initials and tonal markers, so the phonetics provided herein should by no means be considered definitive but simply rough approximations of how these words might have been pronounced at the time of composition).



JEFFREY R. THARSEN 康森傑

The University of Chicago

tharsen@uchicago.edu

Acknowledgments

I express my deep gratitude to the anonymous reviewers, each of whom made substantive recommendations for improvements to this piece; to Thomas J. Mazanec for convening the conference on "Patterns and Networks in Classical Chinese Literature" at which it was first presented; and to Cai Zong-qi for his steadfast encouragement and support. All flaws and errors herein are solely the fault of the author.

Notes

1. "Taishigong zixu" 太史公自序 (Postface of the Grand Scribe), in Sima, *Shi ji*, 19.
2. Karlgren, "On the Authenticity and Nature of the Tso Chuan," 60.
3. Over seventy passages from the *Zuo Commentary* are known to have direct parallels in the *Discourses*. Chang, *Guoyu Zuo zhuan lunji*. For a comparative isometric analysis of passages in the *Zuo Commentary* and the *Guoyu*, see Boltz, "Notes on the Textual Relation." See also Schaberg, *Patterned Past*; and Vogelsang, "From Anecdote to History."

4. Chang, "Cong Guoyu yu Zuozhuan," 419.
5. My use of the term *phonorhetoric* is simply a direct translation of the Chinese term *hanyu yuyin xiucixue* 漢語語音修辭學 as used by scholars like Chen Guanglei 陳光磊 and Li Xingjie 李行杰. One could equally use the term *phonostylistics*, as R. R. K. Hartmann and F. C. Stork's *Dictionary of Language and Linguistics* renders it. On the types of rhetoric exemplified within the speeches, see Egan, "Selections from Tso chuan," 328–29.
6. These types of tripartite analyses have long been well utilized in the many studies of prosodic forms in early Chinese poetry and of early Chinese rhyme prose, Han-era *pian wen* 駢文 "parallel prose" (or *pian ti wen* 駢體文 "parallel-style prose") in particular; see Hightower, "Some Characteristics of Parallel Prose." The first detailed examinations of rhyme and euphony in the *Zuo Commentary* and the *Discourses of the States* were conducted by the eminent Qing phonologists Duan Yucai 段玉裁 (1735–1815), Wang Niansun 王念孫 (1744–1832), and Jiang Yougao 江有誥 (d. 1851). Jiang established the first and as yet only previous substantive attempt to study the rhymes and rhyme patterns within these texts as a whole, presenting entire passages with the rhyme words circled and a short indication of the rhyme group (or groups, in the case of cross-rhymes) in half-width type at the end of each passage; it is a testament to the enduring quality of his work that until recently no scholar has attempted to replicate his methods or build on them. See Duan, *Liu shu yin yun biao*; Wang, *Mao shi qun jing Chu ci gu yun pu*; and Jiang, *Qun jing yun du*. For a list of rhymed passages in the *Zuo Commentary* and *Discourses of the States*, see Lu, *Xian Qin Han Wei Jin Nanbeichao shi*. For analyses of the rhymes in the citations of "songs" (*ge* 歌), "folk songs" (*ou* 謳), "omen-verses" (*yao* 謠), and "recitations" (*song* 誦) in the *Zuo Commentary*, see Hu, "Zuo zhuan ge ou yao song yongyun fenxi"; and Zeng, *Zuozhuan yinshi fushi zhi shijiao yanjiu*.
7. David Schaberg has produced several exemplary studies of the *Zuo Commentary*; his comments on the literary qualities of the speeches, specifically about the principles of *taxis* and rhetoric involved in the composition of these texts, are particularly insightful. Schaberg, *Patterned Past*, 21–22. Given the similarities between the euphonic, rhetorical, and phonorhetorical devices documented in the *prima facie* excavated materials from the Western Zhou dynasty and the speeches preserved in the *Zuo Commentary*, the composers (and/or editors and transmitters) of these speeches certainly seem to have been influenced by the literary styles and forms that flourished during the Western Zhou. See Behr, "Reimende Bronzeinschriften"; Tharsen, "Chinese Euphonics"; and Schaberg, *Patterned Past*.
8. Fu, *Zhongwen xiucixue*, 87.
9. As Ursula Heidbüchel notes, the Duke Zhao chapter comprises approximately one-fifth of the entire text and contains a far greater ratio of discursive to narrative passages than any of the other chapters. Heidbüchel, *Rhetorik im Antiken China*, 8.
10. In English, *he yun* 合韻 can be described as consonance, homoeoteleuton (as in Aristotle's *Rhetorik*), or more generally as a form of "half-rhyme" or "cross-rhyme." For this study I have followed the definitions set forth by Wang Li for *he yun* and *tong yun* 通韻 in *Shi jing yun du*: *he yun* is rhyming between graphs with identical final consonants but different medial vowels (ignoring tone markers, such as *-ʔ, *-h or *-s), while *tong yun* is rhyming between words with identical medial vowels but different finals. Wang, *Shi jing yun du*, 28–36.
11. For a complete explanation of the various symbols used in Schuessler's "minimal" OC reconstructions, see Schuessler, *Minimal Old Chinese and Later Han Chinese*, ix–xii.

12. Lu, *Jingdian shiwen*: 「音泰」.
13. Ibid.: 「下孟反」.
14. Ibid.: 「許又反」.
15. In *Minimal Old Chinese and Later Han Chinese* Schuessler provides *mət as the reconstruction for *wu* 物 but then notes that it is “probably *mut,” and the Baxter-Sagart 2014 reconstruction (2015 edition) is *C.mut; either of these would form a perfect rhyme with *nei* 內 *nûts in the preceding line.
16. Lu, *Jingdian shiwen*: 「古豆反」.
17. Ibid.: 「音因」.
18. Ibid.: 「於嫁反」.
19. Ibid.: 「户孝反」.
20. Ibid.: 「丁丈反」.
21. Ibid.: 「呼報反」.
22. Ibid.: 「烏路反」.
23. Ibid.: 「音洛」.
24. This graph is found in the Tang dynasty stone classics version of the text but is not included in other manuscripts.
25. Tharsen, “Chinese Euphonics,” I.3.B.
26. The speeches preserved in the *Zuo Commentary* have long been renowned for their eloquence and erudition; the rhetorical and structural forms in these speeches demonstrate an ever-greater propensity for repetition and parallelism compared with the orations preserved in the Western Zhou bronze inscriptions and the *Classic of Documents*. This in itself is not enough to establish a timeline for the development of style and form in early Chinese narrative prose, but when combined with analyses of the use of sound and euphonic devices in these texts, it does seem to provide solid evidence for a significant shift from the literary language of the early centuries of the first millennium before the common era and the language and rhetorical styles preserved in the *Zuo Commentary*. Extensive use of parallelism, consistent meter, and rhyme schemes analogous to the familiar patterns of the *Classic of Poetry* can also be identified within slightly earlier narrative prose during this formative period. See Schaberg, *Patterned Past*, 22; and Tharsen, “Chinese Euphonics.”
27. Lu, *Jingdian shiwen*: 「音泰」.
28. Ibid.: 「方元反」.
29. Ibid.: 「音成」.
30. Ibid.: 「乃甘反」.
31. Ibid.: 「於用反」.
32. Ibid.: 「音風」. Schuessler reconstructs OC *feng* 風 simply as *pəm (or *pəms when it means “to criticize”) but notes that Baxter’s OC reconstruction is *p(r)ə/um, so something similar to *prjəm may be correct here.
33. Lu, *Jingdian shiwen*: 「音荀」.
34. Ibid.: 「音于」.
35. Ibid.: 「將丈反」.
36. Ibid.: 「亡交反」.
37. Ibid.: 「才故反」.
38. Ibid.: 「側界反」.
39. Ibid.: 「上照反」.
40. Ibid.: 「居黝反」.

41. Ibid.: 「大計反」.
42. Ibid.: 「五各反」.
43. Ibid.: 「方九反」.
44. Ibid.: 「韋鬼反」.
45. All translations from the *Classic of Poetry* are adapted from Waley, *Book of Songs*.
46. Lu, *Jingdian shiwen*: 「呼歷反」.
47. Ibid.: 「魚呂反」.
48. Ibid.: 「亡甫反」.
49. The words *fen* 忿 *phəns and *qin* 親 *tshin would not have rhymed perfectly in this section, so this may be an ABAB construction rather than AaAa; that said, as *fen* 忿 is in the *wen* 文 rhyme group and *qin* 親 is in the *zhen* 真 rhyme group, and as Wang Li lists two examples of poems in the *Classic of Poetry* that feature a 真文 *he yun* 合韻 cross-rhyme (*Shi jing yun du*, 33), these words at the time may well have been close enough to constitute a rhyme.
50. Lu, *Jingdian shiwen*: 「女乙反」.
51. Ibid.: 「鹿工反」.
52. Ibid.: 「音妹」.
53. Ibid.: 「魚巾反」.
54. Ibid.: 「彼列反」.
55. Ibid.: 「羊朱反」.
56. Ibid.: 「徒回反」.
57. Ibid.: 「如字本或作姚亦宜音桃」.
58. See Wang, *Shi jing yun du*, 33.
59. Ibid.
60. For analyses of phrase-initial rhyming, see Zhu, “Xian Qin Liang Han san ju yunyu zhong de ju shou yun.” For comparisons with other early Chinese narrative corpora, see Tharsen, “Chinese Euphonics”; and Behr, “Reimende Bronzeinschriften.”
61. Like the *Zuo Commentary*, the *Discourses* is also traditionally viewed as a narrative commentary on the *Chunqiu*, the laconic official recorded history of the Spring and Autumn and Warring States periods. As noted in the introductory remarks, Sima Qian identified both as having been written by Zuo Qiuming, the presumptive author of the *Zuo Commentary*, so the texts have been associated since at least the Former Han.
62. This conclusion comes after having analyzed the entirety of the *Discourses* using the *Digital EDOC* and then closely reading the text while looking for phonetic correlations. Outside of the latter half of the “Discourses of Yue” there are indeed a very few short rhyming and cross-rhyming phrases scattered here and there, but these are few in number and generally of limited value. As noted above, that rhyming passages exist in this section has been known for centuries; the late Qing scholar Wei Juxian 衛聚賢 (1898–1990) dated it as chronologically the very last part of the *Discourses*, in part because of the extensive patterns of rhyme. See Wei, *Gu shi yanjiu*, 183–86.
63. Song, *Guoyu buyin*: 「敕六反」.
64. Ibid.: 「求良反，補音其丈反下彊成同，據語曰：時不至不可彊，生事不究，不可彊，成其意言須自然而生非可勉彊也。舊音疑失之本或作強通」.
65. The ctext.org source text has *si* 司 *sə here, but other editions have 四; 司 seems to be an error.
66. Song, *Guoyu buyin*: 「音六，補音力竹反，按此種稊字，經典之訓以先種後熟為種，後種先熟為稊，今據注訓和未詳先儒之學」.

67. It is worth noting that, in this case, the final graphs in the center couplet cross-rhyme in the Baxter-Sagart and traditional reconstructions, but not according to Schuessler's reconstruction for *li* 利 (*rih), which he bases on evidence from minority dialects and spellings of Indic words, and thus he drops the final consonant. See Schuessler, *ABC Etymological Dictionary*, 280. Wang Li has shown that these rhyme groups (*zhi* 制 is in the *yue* 月 rhyme group and *li* 利 is in the *zhi* 質 rhyme group) do cross-rhyme in several poems in the *Classic of Poetry*, but not these specific graphs. See Wang, *Shi jing yun du*, 33.
68. Jiang Yougao adduced three of the four rhyme words in this sequence, with the exception of the first: "affair." See Jiang, *Xian Qin yun du*, 3.
69. However, as Wang Li lists no cross-rhymes in the *Classic of Poetry* between these rhyme groups (*wai* is in the *yue* 月 rhyme group and *nei* is in the *wu* 物 rhyme group), further research into whether or not these words are used in parallel rhyme position in other texts will be necessary to substantiate this.
70. Song, *Guoyu buyin*: 「古禾反」.
71. Ibid.: 「曲王反, 注云: 匡虧也, 字書俱無此訓, 然韋必有所據矣, 俗本作吳, 非是」.
72. Ibid.: 「直覲反」.
73. Ibid.: 「頻忍反」.
74. Eric Henry contends that parallels between this chapter and the "Shi 勢" section of the *Guanzi* 管子 plus its framing of correlative cosmology and yin and yang theory as a basis for statecraft indicate that this chapter should be dated much later than the other chapters of the *Discourses of the States*: "Yueyu Xia," and very possibly all three of the books dealing with Wu and Yue in *Guoyu*, were originally not part of *Guoyu* at all, but formed part of the cluster of Daoist and Huang Lao writings produced in the Huainan court, some of which found their way into *Guanzi* and some of which now form the text known as *Huainanzi*." Henry, "Provenance of the Wu and Yue Chapters," 5–10.
75. See Cook, "Chu jian yunwen fenlei tanxi," 215–58; and Tharsen, "Paleography, Rhetorical Structure, and Content."
76. Schaberg, "Command and the Content of Tradition," 37–41.
77. See Behr, "Reimende Bronzeinschriften"; and Tharsen, "Chinese Euphonics."
78. For a recent highly detailed statistical analysis of rhymes and cross-rhymes in the *Zhuangzi* 莊子, see McCraw, *Stratifying Zhuangzi*.
79. The only true forerunner to the *Digital EDOC* is David Branner's Yintong website (yintong.info), created in 2004 by Branner and Weng Yi 翁翌 and based on Branner's digital version of the *Guangyun* rhyme dictionary. This site includes functions called "Transcription of Poetry" and "Prosody Analysis," in which a user can enter a string of Chinese graphs, and then links to entries from the database (including Branner's phonetic transcription) are provided for each graph. Recently a parsing function similar to the one I developed for the *Digital EDOC* was created for the dictionary associated with the Chinese Text Project (ctext.org) that provides definitions, variant graphic forms, the standard modern pinyin pronunciations, and references to modern lexica for each graph in the input string.
80. See Harbsmeier, "Irrefutable Conjectures." It is worth reiterating that the reconstructions by Pan Wuyun, Zhengzhang Shangfang, Sergei Starostin, Wang Li, and/or other great modern phonologists could equally be used in place of Schuessler's OC renderings with little variation in the overall results. For a comparative study of vowel purity (the theory that words with different vowels did not usually rhyme in early Chinese rhyming poetry)

as evidenced within a range of reconstruction systems, see List et al., “Vowel Purity and Rhyme Evidence”; in their analysis of various reconstructions, List et al. conclude that the 2014 Baxter-Sagart system hews closest to the vowels represented by the rhyme words in the *Classic of Poetry*.

81. For an overview of modern OC reconstruction methodologies, see relevant chapters in the 2015 *Oxford Handbook of Chinese Linguistics* and entries in the 2017 *Encyclopedia of Chinese Language and Linguistics*.

References

- Baxter, William, and Laurent Sagart. *Old Chinese: A New Reconstruction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014.
- “The Baxter-Sagart Reconstruction of Old Chinese,” version 1.1, 13 October 2015. <http://ocbaxtersagart.lsa.umich.edu>.
- Behr, Wolfgang. “Reimende Bronzeinschriften und die Entstehung der chinesischen Endreimdichtung.” PhD diss., Goethe-Universität, 1997.
- Boltz, William. “Notes on the Textual Relation between the ‘Kuo yü’ and the ‘Tso chuan.’” *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London* 53, no. 3 (1990): 491–502.
- Chang Yi-Jen 張以仁. “Cong *Guoyu* yu *Zuozhuan* benzhi shang de chayi shilun houren dui *Guoyu* de piping (shang)” 從國語與左傳本質上的差異試論後人對國語的批評（上）(Theories on Later Scholars’ Critiques of *The Discourses of the States* Based on the Nature of Differences in *The Discourses* and the *Zuo Commentary*). *Hanxue yanjiu* 漢學研究 (Sinological Studies) 1, no. 2 (1983): 419–53.
- . *Guoyu Zuo zhuan lunji* 國語左傳論集 (Collected Essays on the *Discourses of the States* and the *Zuo Commentary*). Taipei: Dongsheng chubanshiye gongsi, 1980.
- Chen Guanglei 陳光磊 and Li Xingjie 李行杰. “Zhongguo gudai yuyin xiucixue lilun de zhuoyue pianzhang—du Liu Xie *Wen xin diao long*: Shenglü” 中国古代语音修辞学理论的卓越篇章—读刘勰《文心雕龙·声律》(The Eminent Source for the Theory of Chinese Ancient Phonorhetoric: Reading the ‘Sheng lü’ chapter of Liu Xie’s *Wen xin diao long*). In *Xiuci lun gao* 修辞论稿 (Essays on Rhetoric), 165–73. Beijing: Beijing Language and Culture University Press, 2001.
- Chunqiu Zuo zhuan* 春秋左傳 (*Zuo Commentary to the Spring and Autumn Annals*). In *Wuyingdian shisanjing zhushu* 武英殿十三經注疏. [Qing] Imperial Wuying-Palace edition. ctext.org/library.pl?if=en&file=80223&page=104.
- Cook, Scott. “Chu jian yunwen fenlei tanxi” 楚簡韻文分類探析 (A Categorical Analysis of Rhyming in Chu Bamboo Manuscripts). *Chutu wenxian yu guwenzi yanjiu* 出土文獻與古文字研究 (Studies of Excavated Manuscripts and Paleography) 4 (2011): 215–58.
- Duan Yucai 段玉裁 (1735–1815). *Liu shu yin yun biao* 六書音韻表 (Charts of Rhymes for the Six Categories of Chinese Characters). *Huang Qing jing jie*, 1829.
- Egan, Ronald. “Selections from Tso chuan: Translation and Analysis.” PhD diss., Harvard University, 1976.
- Fu Lipu 傅隸樸. *Zhongwen xiucixue* 中文修辭學 (Chinese Rhetoric). Xingzhou: Youlian chubanshe, 1964.
- Guoyu* 國語 (Discourses of the States). Sibu congkan chubian 四部叢刊初編 edition. ctext.org/library.pl?if=en&file=77611&page=144.
- Harbsmeier, Christoph. “Irrefutable Conjectures: A Review of William. H. Baxter and Laurent Sagart, *Old Chinese: A New Reconstruction*.” *Monumenta Serica* 64, no. 2 (2016): 445–504.

- Hartmann, R. R. K., and F. C. Stork. *Dictionary of Language and Linguistics*. New York: Wiley, 1972.
- Heidbüchel, Ursula. "Rhetorik im Antiken China: Eine Untersuchung der Ausdrucksformen höfischer Rede im Zuo Zhuan, Herzog Zhao" (Rhetoric in Early China: A Study of Expressions of Courtly Speech in the Duke Zhao Chapter of the Zuo Commentary). PhD diss., Westfälische Wilhelms-Universität Münster, 1994.
- Henry, Eric. "Provenance of the Wu and Yue Chapters" Unpublished manuscript, 2018.
- Hightower, James. "Some Characteristics of Parallel Prose." In *Studies in Chinese Literature*, edited by John L. Bishop, 108–39. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1965.
- Hu Ping 胡萍. "Zuo zhuan ge ou yao song yongyun fenxi" 《左传》歌讴谣诵用韵分析 (Analyses of Rhyming in the Songs and Verses of the Zuo Commentary). *Chuzhou xueyuan xuebao* 滁州學院學報 (Journal of Chuzhou University) 8, no. 4 (2006): 5–7.
- Jiang Yougao 江有誥 (d. 1851). *Qun jing yun du* 群經韻讀 (Rhymes in the Classics). In *Yin xue shi shu* 音學十書 (Ten Books on Phonetics). Shanghai: Zhongguo shudian, 1928.
- . *Xian Qin yun du* 先秦韻讀 (Rhymes in Pre-Qin Works). In *Yin xue shi shu* 音學十書 (Ten Books on Phonetics). Shanghai: Zhongguo shudian, 1928.
- Karlgren, Bernhard. "On the Authenticity and Nature of the Tso Chuan." *Göteborgs högskolas årsskrift* 32, no. 3 (1962): 3–65.
- List, Johann-Mattis, et al. "Vowel Purity and Rhyme Evidence in Old Chinese Reconstruction." *Lingua Sinica* 3, no. 5 (2017): 1–17.
- Lu Deming 陸德明 (ca. 550–630). *Jingdian shiwen* 經典釋文 (Glosses on the Classics). In *Qinding siku quanshu* 欽定四庫全書 (Complete Library of the Four Treasuries made by Imperial Orders). Beijing: Shumu wenxian chubanshe, 1991.
- Lu Qinli 逯欽立 (1910–73). *Xian Qin Han Wei Jin Nanbeichao shi* 先秦漢魏晉南北朝詩 (Poems of the Pre-Qin, Han, Wei, Jin, and the Southern and Northern Dynasties). Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1983.
- McCraw, David. *Stratifying Zhuangzi: Rhyme and Other Quantitative Evidence*. Taipei: Academia Sinica Institute of Linguistics, 2010.
- Schaberg, David. "Command and the Content of Tradition." In *The Magnitude of Ming: Command, Allotment, and Fate in Chinese Culture*, edited by Christopher Lupke, 23–48. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2005.
- . *A Patterned Past: Form and Thought in Early Chinese Historiography*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2001.
- Schuessler, Axel. *ABC Etymological Dictionary of Old Chinese*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2007.
- . *Minimal Old Chinese and Later Han Chinese: A Companion to Grammata Serica Recensa*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2009.
- Sima Qian 司馬遷 (145–86? BCE). *Shi ji* 史記 (Records of the Grand Scribe). Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2002.
- Song Xiang 宋庠 (996–1066). *Guoyu buyin* 國語補音 (Supplemental Phonetics for *The Discourses of the States*). In *Qinding siku quanshu* 欽定四庫全書 (Complete Library of the Four Treasuries made by Imperial Orders). Beijing: Shumu wenxian chubanshe, 1991.
- Sybesma, et al. *Encyclopedia of Chinese Language and Linguistics*. Leiden: Brill, 2016.
- Tharsen, Jeffrey. "Chinese Euphonics: Phonetic Patterns, Phonorhetoric, and Literary Artistry in Early Chinese Narrative Texts." PhD diss., University of Chicago, 2015.
- . "The Paleography, Rhetorical Structure and Content of the Shanghai Museum Chu Bamboo Manuscript 'San de' 參德" MA thesis, University of Chicago, 2011.

- Vogelsang, Kai. "From Anecdote to History: Observations on the Composition of the *Zuozhuan*." *Oriens Extremus* 50 (2011): 99–124.
- Waley, Arthur. *The Book of Songs*. New York: Grove, 1996.
- Wang Li 王力 (1900–1986). *Shi jing yun du* 詩經韻讀 (Rhymes in the *Classic of Poetry*). Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1980.
- Wang Niansun 王念孫 (1744–1832). *Mao shi qun jing Chu ci gu yun pu* 毛詩羣經楚辭古韻譜 (Lists of Rhyme Words in *The Mao Poetry*, the Classics, and *The Songs of Chu*). Shangyu: Luoshi jiben, Dongfang xuehui congkan, 1924.
- Wang, William S.-Y., and Chaofen Sun. *The Oxford Handbook of Chinese Linguistics*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2015.
- Wei Juxian 衛聚賢 (1898–1990). *Gu shi yanjiu* 古史研究 (Historical Studies). Shanghai: Xinyue shudian, 1928.
- Zeng Qinliang 曾勤良. *Zuozhuan yinshi fushi zhi shijiao yanjiu* 左傳引詩賦詩之詩教研究 (Studies of Poetic Education through Quotations of Poetry in the *Zuo Commentary*). Taipei: Wenjin chubanshe, 1993.
- Zhu Chengping 朱承平. "Xian Qin Liang Han san ju yunyu zhong de ju shou yun" 先秦兩漢散句韻語中的句首韻 (Phrase-Initial Rhyming in Pre-Qin and Han Rhymeprose). *Jiangxi shehui kexue* 江西社會科學 (Jiangxi Social Sciences) 9 (1997): 55–58.