

**DVPR 41700 / SALC 48317:  
Readings in Madhyamaka**

Winter term, 2015  
Swift Hall 403  
Fridays, 1:00-3:50

Instructor: Dan Arnold

Office hours: Swift 401A, **Wednesdays, 2:30-4:30** (or by arrangement with instructor); for appointments during regular office hours, sign up on the sheet kept by Julia Ivory-Woods (773-702-7049) in the Martin Marty Center

E-mail: d-arnold@uchicago.edu

Phone: 702-8276

**Objectives and requirements of the course:** This seminar will consist in a close reading of the beginning of chapter 9 of Śāntideva's *Bodhi[sattva]caryāvatāra* (*BCA*, "Introduction to the Bodhisattva's Practice"), with particular reference to the extensive commentary of Prajñākaramati (c. 950-1030 CE), the *Bodhicaryāvatārapañjikā*. Particularly the second verse of *BCA* chapter 9 is a *locus classicus* for characteristically Mādhyamika elaboration of the "two-truths" doctrine, and in Prajñākaramati's lengthy discussion of this we have, according to Chr. Lindtner, "the most comprehensive account of the *satyadvaya*-problem extant in Sanskrit" (Lindtner 1981, p.164)

While Śāntideva's text is among the most often translated of all Buddhist texts (see, on this, especially Gomez 1999), and while there has in recent years been increasing attention to the thought (perhaps especially the ethics) of Śāntideva – often, lately, with reference to the one other text he is known to have written, the *Śikṣāsamuccaya* (see, e.g., Clayton 2006, Goodman 2009, Mroziak 2007, and also, on the text and character of the *Śikṣāsamuccaya*, Harrison 2007) – it remains the case that there is very little work on Prajñākaramati's important and interesting commentary. This is despite the facts that not only is *BCA* 9 (more than any other chapter in the text) intelligible only with reference to a commentary, but also that Prajñākaramati seems to have been a very influential late Mādhyamika thinker in India. Prajñākaramati was, among other things, the first Mādhyamika commentator after Candrakīrti (fl. c. 600 CE) who is known even to have *cited* (much less to have been influenced by) Candrakīrti's work – indeed, he seems to have figured importantly in the late Indian recuperation of Candrakīrti's long-neglected work, which subsequently went on to become decisively influential for virtually all Tibetan traditions of Buddhist philosophy. (On the relatively late "resurrection" of Candrakīrti, see Vose 2009, whose excellent book includes a fair amount on the significance of Prajñākaramati in particular.) One of the few studies specifically on *BCA* chapter 9 (the 1977 dissertation of Sweet) is informed more by the Tibetan reception of this work than by Prajñākaramati's commentary, and a thorough study of the latter remains a desideratum.

Fortunately, however, there is a fairly recent translation of Prajñākaramati's commentary on *BCA* 9 (in the 1994 dissertation of Oldmeadow), and that will represent, for most involved in this seminar, our primary point of access to the text. (In addition, Lindtner 1981 includes a translation just of Prajñākaramati's translation on *BCA* 9.2.) This can be usefully supplemented by some of the credible translations of Śāntideva's root text; the translation by Crosby and Skilton (2008), whose endnotes for Chapter 9 draw on Prajñākaramati's commentary, is available at the Seminary Coop, and the 1979 translation by Batchelor (done from the Tibetan) incorporates a twelfth-century Tibetan

commentary into the chapter (that of Thogs-med bzang-po. It is to be hoped, however, that our in-depth consideration of Prajñākaramati's commentary will include significant reference to the Sanskrit (the definitive edition of which remains that of La Vallée Poussin, published in fascicles over the period 1901-1914), and/or to the Tibetan translation thereof, as students are able. (The Tibetan translation of Prajñākaramati's commentary on chapter 9 is available, in a published critical edition, on Dropbox, but it's also available from the Asian Classics Input Project at [<http://www.aciparchive.org/ace/#lyt\(vol\)col\(tendg\)title\(2802\)pg\(369\)>](http://www.aciparchive.org/ace/#lyt(vol)col(tendg)title(2802)pg(369)), where there are both scans of the folios from the sDe-dge edition of the bsTan-'gyur, and searchable transliteration of the text.)

The Bibliography below gives details on all of the foregoing references, as well as a few other things relevant to the study of Śāntideva, Prajñākaramati, late Madhyamaka, etc. Only the translation of Crosby and Skilton is available for purchase at the Seminary Coop; most of the other items are (or will soon be) on reserve at Regenstein Library (see the course's Blackboard website for details), and/or in a Dropbox file to be shared with everyone in the seminar. With these tools at our disposal – and referring chiefly to the translations of Oldmeadow, Crosby and Skilton, and Batchelor, as well as the edition of La Vallée Poussin and/or the Tibetan translation – our *modus operandi* will be simply to read the text closely from the beginning, attending particularly to the philosophical sense of the arguments (but also, as far as possible, to philological considerations, translation judgments, etc.). In addition to exhibiting regular attendance and spirited participation in discussion, students will be required to write a final paper of moderate length (15-20 pages), engaging some aspect of the text and/or its arguments, and/or issues or thinkers overlapping with the world of concerns evinced in our text(s); the paper will be **due Friday, March 20**. N.b.: *Late papers will not be accepted without prior notice*.

### Calendar of class sessions:

- Week 1 (Friday, January 9)
- Week 2 (Friday, January 16)
- Week 3 (Friday, January 23)
- Week 4 (Friday, January 30)
- Week 5 (Friday, February 6)
- Week 6 (Friday, February 13)
- Week 7 (Friday, February 20 – NO CLASS!)
- Week 8 (Friday, February 27)
- Week 9 (Friday, March 6 – NO CLASS!)
- Week 10 (Friday, March 13)

***Papers due Friday, March 20!***

**Bibliography.** Pretty much all of this will be, if it isn't already, on reserve at Regenstein Library, along with such things as a variety of other translations of Śāntideva's text; only one of the below items is on sale at the Seminary Coop Bookstore.

Batchelor, Stephen, trans. 1979. *A Guide to the Bodhisattva's Way of Life*. Dharamsala: Library of Tibetan Works and Archives.

Clayton, Barbra. 2006. *Moral Theory in Śāntideva's Śikṣāsamuccaya: Cultivating the Fruits of Virtue*. London: Routledge.

- Crosby, Kate, and Andrew Skilton, trans. 2008. *The Bodhicaryāvatāra*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. (**Available at the Seminary Coop Bookstore.**)
- Dreyfus, Georges, and Sara McClintock, eds. 2003. *The Svātantrika-Prāsaṅgika Distinction: What Difference Does a Difference Make?* Boston: Wisdom Publications.
- Gómez, Luis O. 1999. "The Way of the Translators: Three Recent Translations of Śāntideva's *Bodhicaryāvatāra*," *Buddhist Literature* 1: 262-354.
- Goodman, Charles. 2009. *Consequences of Compassion: An Interpretation and Defense of Buddhist Ethics*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Harrison, Paul. 2007. "The Case of the Vanishing Poet: New Light on Śāntideva and the *Śikṣā-samuccaya*," Konrad Klaus and Jens-Uwe Hartmann, eds., *Indica et Tibetica: Festschrift für Michael Hahn*, pp.215-248. Vienna: Arbeitskreis für Tibetische und Buddhistische Studien Universität Wien.
- La Vallée Poussin, Louis, ed. 1901-1914. *Bodhicaryāvatārapañjikā, Prajñākaramati's Commentary to the Bodhicaryāvatāra of Śāntideva*. Bibliotheca Indica, Collection of Oriental Works, New series Nos. 983, 1031, 10921, 1126, 1139, 1305, 1399. Calcutta: The Asiatic Society of Bengal.
- Lindtner, Chr. 1981. "Atiśa's Introduction to the Two Truths, and its Sources," *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 9: 161-214.
- Mrozik, Susanne. 2007. *Virtuous Bodies: The Physical Dimensions of Morality in Buddhist Ethics*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Oldmeadow, Peter. 1994. "A Study of the Wisdom Chapter (*Prajñāpāramitā Pariccheda*) of the *Bodhicaryāvatārapañjikā* of Prajñākaramati." Ph.D. dissertation, Australian National University.
- Ruegg, David Seyfort. 1981. *The Literature of the Madhyamaka School of Philosophy in India*. [A History of Indian Literature (ed. Jan Gonda), Vol. VII, Fasc. 1.] Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz.
- Saito Akira. 1993. *A Study of Akṣayamati (=Śāntideva)'s Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra as Found in the Tibetan Manuscripts from Dunhuang*. Research Report of the Grant-in-Aid for Scientific Research (C), 1990.4-1993.4, Mie University.
- \_\_\_\_\_. 1996. "Śāntideva in the History of Mādhyamika Philosophy," in Kalpakam Sankarnaryan, et al, eds., *Buddhism in India and Abroad*, pp.257-273. Mumbai: Somaiya Publications.
- \_\_\_\_\_. 2000. *A Study of the Dun-huang Recension of the Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra*. Research Report of the Grant-in-Aid for Scientific Research (C), 1997.3-2000.3, Mie University.
- Sweet, Michael J. 1977. "Śāntideva and the Mādhyamika: The *Prajñāpāramitā-Pariccheda* of the *Bodhicaryāvatāra*." Ph.D. dissertation, University of Wisconsin-Madison.

Vose, Kevin A. 2009. *Resurrecting Candrakīrti: Disputes in the Tibetan Creation of Prāsaṅgika*. Boston: Wisdom Publications.

Williams, Paul. 1998. *Altruism and Reality: Studies in the Philosophy of the Bodhicaryāvatāra*. Richmond, Surrey: Curzon.