

**DVPR (605) 42800:  
Madhyamaka**

Fall term, 2010  
Swift Hall 403  
Fridays, 1:00-3:50

Instructor: Dan Arnold

E-mail: d-arnold@uchicago.edu

Phone: 702-8276

Office hours: Swift 401A, Tuesdays, 3:30-5:00 (or by arrangement with instructor); for appointments during regular office hours, contact instructor's secretary, Susie McGee (Martin Marty Center).

**Required Readings:**

The following books are (or will soon be) available at the Seminary Coop Bookstore, and on reserve at Regenstein Library:

- Jay Garfield, *Fundamental Wisdom of the Middle Way: Nāgārjuna's Mūlamadhyamakakārikā* (Oxford University Press, 1995)
- Jan Westerhoff, *Nāgārjuna's Madhyamaka: A Philosophical Introduction* (Oxford University Press, 2009)
- Jan Westerhoff, *The Dispeller of Disputes: Nāgārjuna's Vigrahavyāvartanī* (Oxford University Press, 2010)
- C. W. Huntington, *The Emptiness of Emptiness: An Introduction to Early Indian Mādhyamika* (University of Hawai'i Press, 1989)
- Padmakara Translation Group, *The Adornment of the Middle Way: Shantarakshita's Madhyamakalankara with Commentary by Jamgon Mipham* (Shambhala Publications)

Additional readings (including some selected works, representative of various trends in scholarly interpretation, which are not specifically indicated on this syllabus) are available on reserve, electronic and otherwise.

**Course Requirements:**

In addition to exemplifying regular attendance and spirited participation in discussion, students will be required to submit, at the end of the term, either a philosophical paper of moderate length (15-25 pages), *or* an annotated bibliography of works related to some aspect of the philosophical study of Madhyamaka. **Papers will be due on December 10, and will not be accepted late without prior arrangement.**

## Tentative Schedule of Topics and Readings

### Week 1 (Friday, October 1):

Introduction to the course.

**Recommended background reading:** Dan Arnold, “Madhyamaka Buddhism” (Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy; <<http://www.iep.utm.edu/b/b-madhyam.htm>>; Westerhoff, *Nāgārjuna’s Madhyamaka*, pp.3-18; David Seyfort Rugg, *The Literature of the Madhyamaka School of Philosophy in India* (peruse on reserve); Andrew P. Tuck, *Comparative Philosophy and the Philosophy of Scholarship: On the Western Interpretation of Nāgārjuna*.

### Week 2 (Friday, October 8):

**Nāgārjuna on causation: *Mūlamadhyamakakārikā*, chapter 1 (with Bhāviveka’s commentary).** Basic text: Louis de La Vallée Poussin, ed., *Mūlamadhyamakakārikās (Mādhyamikasūtras) de Nāgārjuna, avec la Prasannapadā Commentaire de Candrakīrti* (Bibliotheca Buddhica, Vol. IV), as supplemented by J. W. De Jong, “Text-critical Notes on the *Prasannapadā*” (*Indo-Iranian Journal* 20, nos.1/2: 25-59; nos.3/4: 217-252; on e-reserve). Based on his revisions, De Jong also produced an edition of Nāgārjuna’s *kārikās* alone: *Mūlamadhyamakakārikāḥ* (Madras: Adyar Library and Research Centre, 1977).

**Reading:** Mark Siderits and Shoryu Katsura, “*Mūlamadhyamakakārikā* I-X,” pp.129-140, in consultation with the Sanskrit text if possible; cf. Garfield, Garfield, *Fundamental Wisdom of the Middle Way*, pp.3-5

Jay Garfield, *Fundamental Wisdom of the Middle Way*, pp.87-123

William Ames, “Bhāvaviveka’s *Prajñāpradīpa*: A Translation of Chapter One: ‘Examination of Causal Conditions’ (*Pratyaya*)” (*Journal of Indian Philosophy* 21 & 22: 209-259, 93-135 [respectively]; e-reserve)

Westerhoff, *Nāgārjuna’s Madhyamaka*, pp.91-127

### Week 3 (Friday, October 15):

**Nāgārjuna on other categories: *Mūlamadhyamakakārikā*, continued.**

**Reading:** Mark Siderits and Shoryu Katsura, “*Mūlamadhyamakakārikā* I-X,” pp.140-185; cf. Garfield, *Fundamental Wisdom of the Middle Way*, pp.6-30

Garfield, *Fundamental Wisdom of the Middle Way*, pp.124-135, 178-182, 189-195

Westerhoff, *Nāgārjuna’s Madhyamaka*, pp.19-52, 129-164

Jay Garfield and Graham Priest, “Nāgārjuna and the Limits of Thought” (*Philosophy East & West* 53/1: 1-21; e-reserve)

Eviatar Shulman, “The Commitments of a Madhyamaka Trickster: Innovation in Candrakīrti’s *Prasanna-padā*” (*Journal of Indian Philosophy* 38: 379-417; e-reserve)

**Week 4 (Friday, October 22):**

**Nāgārjuna answers objections: The *Vigrahavyāvartanī*.** **Basic text:** The critical edition of E. J. Johnston and Arnold Kunst, included in Kāmaleswar Bhattacharya, *The Dialectical Method of Nāgārjuna*; cf. Yoshiyasu Yonezawa, “*Vigrahavyāvartanī*: Sanskrit Transliteration and Tibetan Translation,” *Journal of Naritasan Institute for Buddhist Studies* 31: 209-333.

**Reading:** Jan Westerhoff, *The Dispeller of Disputes*, in consultation with Sanskrit and/or Tibetan text(s), if possible; cf. the translation of Kāmaleswar Bhattacharya, *The Dialectical Method of Nāgārjuna*, pp. 89-138

Westerhoff, *Nāgārjuna’s Madhyamaka*, pp.165-182

Mark Siderits, “The Madhyamaka Critique of Epistemology I” (*Journal of Indian Philosophy* 8: 307-335; e-reserve)

**Week 5 (Friday, October 29): NO CLASS (AAR)**

**Week 6 (Friday, November 5):**

**Nāgārjuna, *Vigrahavyāvartanī*, continued: On language and the nature of negation.**

**Reading:** Continuing with Jan Westerhoff, *The Dispeller of Disputes* (in consultation with Sanskrit text, if possible); cf. the translation of Kāmaleswar Bhattacharya, *The Dialectical Method of Nāgārjuna*, pp. 89-138

Westerhoff, *Nāgārjuna’s Madhyamaka*, pp.53-65, 183-198

**Week 7 (Friday, November 12):**

**Candrakīrti’s primer: *Madhyamakāvātāra*, chapter 6.** **Basic text:** Louis de La Vallée Poussin, ed., *Madhyamakāvātāra par Candrakīrti: Traduction tibétaine* (Bibliotheca Buddhica, Vol. IX).

**Reading:** C. W. Huntington, *The Emptiness of Emptiness*, pp.5-142, 157-184 (plus endnotes), in consultation with basic text, if possible

C. W. Huntington, “Was Candrakīrti a Prāsaṅgika?” in Dreyfus and McClintock, eds., *The Svātantrika-Prāsaṅgika Distinction*, pp. 67-91

William Ames, “The Notion of *Svabhāva* in the Thought of Candrakīrti” (*Journal of Indian Philosophy* 10: 161-71; e-reserve)

**Week 8 (Friday, November 19):**

Post-Dharmakīrtian Madhyamaka I: Śāntarakṣita. Basic text: Śāntarakṣita's *Madhyamakālaṃkāra* (wholly extant only in Tibetan translation, an edition of which is comprised in the selection from Ichigo)

**Reading**: Padmakara Translation Group, *The Adornment of the Middle Way*, pp.1-66, with reference to as much of (the translation of) Mipham's commentary as you can manage, and in consultation with the basic text, if possible

Cf., as well, Masamichi Ichigo, ed., trans., "Śāntarakṣita's *Madhyamakālaṃkāra*" (in Luis Gómez and Jonathan Silk, eds., *Studies in the Literature of the Great Vehicle: Three Mahāyāna Buddhist Texts*, pp. 141-240; complete selection on reserve; text and translation alone on e-reserve)

**Week 9 (Friday, November 26): NO CLASS (Thanksgiving)**

**Week 10 (Friday, December 3):**

Post-Dharmakīrtian Madhyamaka II: Kamalaśīla and the "path" literature.

**Reading**: Kamalaśīla, 1st and 3rd *Bhāvanākrama*, in Martin Adam, "Meditation and the Concept of Insight in Kamalaśīla's *Bhāvanākramas*" (Ph.D. dissertation, McGill University, 2002), pp.117-159 (1st *Bhāvanākrama*, or "The Process of Meditation I"; Sanskrit and Tibetan texts at pp.160-177), pp.230-260 (3rd *Bhāvanākrama*, or "The Process of Meditation III"; Sanskrit and Tibetan texts at pp.261-280).

**Papers due Friday, December 10!**