

**DVPR 30302:**  
**Indian Philosophy II**  
(IDENT. SALC 20902/30902, RLST 24202, HREL 30300)

Spring term 2013  
Swift Hall 400  
Tuesdays and Thursdays, 10:30-11:50

Instructor: Dan Arnold

Office hours: Swift 401A, Tuesdays, 3:00-5:00 (or by arrangement); contact my secretary (Susie McGee, 702-7049) in the Martin Marty Center for an appointment

E-mail: d-arnold@uchicago.edu

Phone: 702-8276

Syllabus online at: <<http://home.uchicago.edu/~daarnold/IndianPhilosophyII2013.pdf>>

**Conception of the Course:**

With Part I of this course (taught in the winter term by Prof. Matthew Kapstein) having surveyed some of the relevant background to Indian philosophical traditions, the present course takes up the emergence and development of more systematic canons of reasoning. Specifically, this course will consist in several different soundings in various of the classical Indian “*darśanas*” (philosophical “viewpoints” or schools), with particular attention to the inter-traditional standards of reason and argument that were systematized – chiefly under the influence of the schools of Nyāya, Pūrva Mīmāṃsā, and Buddhist Epistemology – from roughly the sixth century onwards. Thus, we will attend to such issues as the characteristically Indian emphasis on *pramāṇas* (“reliable epistemic warrants”) and the *prāmāṇya* (“validity”) thereof; philosophy of language; scripture and hermeneutics; and theism and atheism. In considering these issues, significant attention will be given not only to works that exemplify the modern study of classical Indian philosophy, but also to primary sources in translation. While even good translations of Sanskrit philosophical works are often very difficult of access for the non-specialist, such translations will be considered in hopes of appreciating some of the discursive practices that distinguish all of the various schools surveyed as characteristically *Indian*. Particular attention will be paid to what is arguably chief among the distinctively “Indic” characteristics of the arguments we will consider: the centrality for this discourse of Sanskritic grammar and linguistics.

**Required Readings:**

The following titles are (or will soon be) available at the Seminary Coop Bookstore, and on reserve at Regenstein Library:

- **Jonardon Ganeri**, *Philosophy in Classical India: The Proper Work of Reason*
- **Andrew Nicholson**, *Unifying Hinduism: Philosophy and Identity in Indian Intellectual History* (also available electronically through the library at <<http://tinyurl.com/bcsbhby>>

All other assigned and recommended readings are on reserve at Regenstein Library, with nearly all selections available (or soon to be available) on electronic reserve through <<http://chalk9.uchicago.edu/>>. In addition, students should be aware of the invaluable bibliographic resource that is the “Bibliography” volume of Karl Potter, ed.,

*Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies*, a continuously updated version of which is available online at <<http://faculty.washington.edu/kpotter/ckeyt/home.htm>>.

### **Course Requirements:**

In addition to regular attendance and spirited participation in (or at least, alert attention to) discussion, two written exercises will be assigned. The first will be a brief *take-home exam, due at the first meeting of the sixth week* (=Tue., May 7); the second will be an 8- to 12-page paper, due no later than Thursday, June 13.

>> **For useful help in writing philosophical papers, see Jim Pryor's website:** <<http://www.jimpryor.net/teaching/guidelines/writing.html>>

### **Schedule of Topics and Readings:**

**WEEK 1** (Tue., April 2 / Thur., April 4): Introduction: The philosophical study of Indian philosophy and the "specter of Orientalism"

**Reading** (for Thur.): **Wilhelm Halbfass**, "Research and Reflection: Responses to my Respondents" (e-reserve); **Randall Collins**, *The Sociology of Philosophies: A Global Theory of Intellectual Change*, pp.224-255 (e-reserve); **Ganeri**, *Philosophy in Classical India*, pp.1-17

**WEEK 2** (Tue., April 9 / Thur., April 11): The Buddhist transformation of Indian philosophy: The influence of Dignāga

**Reading:** **Richard Hayes**, *Dignāga on the Interpretation of Signs*, pp.133-142 ("Sensation in the *Pramāṇasamuccaya*," e-reserve); **Dignāga**, *Pramāṇasamuccaya* 1.1-12 (Hattori, trans., *Dignāga, On Perception*, pp.23-31, plus endnotes; on e-reserve); **Ganeri**, *Philosophy in Classical India*, pp.17-22, 97-106

**WEEK 3** (Tue., April 16 / Thur. April 18): The Mīmāṃsakas rejoin: A common-sense epistemology in service of some counter-intuitive commitments

**Reading: Tuesday:** **Larry McCrea, trans.**, *Śābarabhāṣya* [selections], pp.1-15 (e-reserve; compare, if you can, the translation of Ganganath Jha, also on e-reserve); **Kei Kataoka**, *Kumārila on Truth, Omniscience, and Killing*, pp.228-271 (e-reserve); **John Taber**, "What Did Kumārila Bhaṭṭa Mean by *svataḥ prāmāṇya*?" (e-reserve)

**Thursday:** **John Taber**, *A Hindu Critique of Buddhist Epistemology: Kumārila on perception*, pp.78-83, plus endnotes ("Refutation of the Buddhist identification of *pramāṇa* and *phala*"); 93-112, plus endnotes ("The defense of conceptualized perception"; both on e-reserve, the latter under the title "The determination of perception (excerpt)")

**WEEK 4 (Tue., April 23 / Thur., April 25):** Back to the Buddhists: The nominalism of the doctrine of *apoha* (“exclusion”)...

**Reading:** *Tuesday:* **Eltschinger, et al**, *Can the Veda Speak?*, pp.33-78 (e-reserve)

*Thursday:* **Shōryū Katsura**, “The *Apoha* Theory of Dignāga” (e-reserve); **Mark Siderits**, “Śrughna by Dusk” (e-reserve); **John Dunne**, *Foundations of Dharmakīrti’s Philosophy*, pp.353-60 (translation of *Pramānavārttika* 1.137-142, with *svavṛtti*; e-reserve); **Ganeri**, *Philosophy in Classical India*, pp.104-114

**WEEK 5 (Tue., April 30 / Thur., May 2):** ... notwithstanding the cogency of which, a Mīmāṃsaka case for the reality of universals and the eternity of language

**Reading:** **Larry McCrea, trans.**, *Śābarabhāṣya* [selections], pp.11-12, 15-20 (e-reserve; compare the translation of Jha, pp.16-125); **Larry McCrea**, “The Hierarchical Organization of Language in Mīmāṃsā Interpretive Theory” (e-reserve); **V. N. Volosinov**, *Marxism and the Philosophy of Language*, Part II, Chapter 1: “Two Trends of Thought in Philosophy of Language” (e-reserve); **Francis X. Clooney**, *Thinking Ritually: Rediscovering the Pūrva Mīmāṃsā of Jaimini*, pp.131-61 (e-reserve)

**WEEK 6 (Tue., May 7 / Thur., May 9):** “Vedānta” as *Uttara Mīmāṃsā*

**Reading:** **John Taber**, “Kumārila the Vedāntin?” (e-reserve); **George Thibaut, trans.**, *The Vedānta Sūtras of Bādarāyana with the commentary by Śaṅkara*, Part I, pp.1-45 (= *Vedāntasūtrabhāṣyam* on I.1.1-I.1.4; e-reserve; also available online at <<http://www.sacred-texts.com/hin/sbe34/index.htm>>); **Thomas Nagel**, “The Objective Self” (e-reserve)

**WEEK 7 (Tue., May 14 / Thur., May 16):** Back to “self-awareness” (*svasaṃvedana*): The Buddhist doctrine and its reception and critique in *Śaiva Siddhānta*

**Reading:** **Alex Watson**, “Bhaṭṭa Rāmakaṇṭha’s Elaboration of Self-Awareness (*svasaṃvedana*), and How it Differs from Dharmakīrti’s Exposition of the Concept” (e-reserve); **Isabelle Ratié**, “The Dreamer and the Yogin: On the relationship between Buddhist and Śaiva idealisms” (e-reserve)

**WEEK 8 (Tue., May 21 / Thur., May 23):** Philosophy and the problem of religious pluralism: the metaphysical perspectivalism of the Jains

**Reading:** **B. K. Matilal**, *The Central Philosophy of Jainism* (on reserve, but also downloadable at <<http://tinyurl.com/d5tcf8l>>); **Ganeri**, *Philosophy in Classical India*, pp.128-150

**WEEK 9 (Tue., May 28 / Thur., May 30):** Towards an appreciation of Indian philosophy in modernity: On philosophy and the construction of identity

**Reading:** **Andrew Nicholson**, *Unifying Hinduism: Philosophy and Identity in Indian Intellectual History*

**WEEK 10 (Tue., June 4):** By way of a conclusion: More on the Indian philosophical encounter with modernity

**Reading:** Jonardon Ganeri, *The Lost Age of Reason*, pp.1-21 (e-reserve); A. C. Mukerji, "The Realist's Conception of Idealism" (e-reserve)

**Final papers due by Thursday, June 13!**